DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 240 254 CE 037 913

AUTHOR	Paul, Samuel
TITLE	Training for Public Administration and Management in Developing Countries. A Review. World Bank Staff Working Papers Number 584. Management and Development Series Number 11.
INSTITUTION	World Bank, Washington, D. C.
REPORT NO	ISBN-0-8213-0234-5
PUB DATE	Jul 83
NOTE	132p.
AVAILABLE FROM	World Bank Publications, P.O. Box 37525, Washington, DC 20013.
PUB TYPE	Information Analyses (070)
EDRS PRICE	MF01 Plus Postage. PC Not Available from EDRS.
DESCRIPTORS	Administrator Education; *Developing Nations; Educational Policy; Foreign Countries; Government (Administrative Body); Higher Education; Labor Force Development; *Management Development; *Program Effectiveness; *Public Administration; *Public Administration Education; State of the Art Reviews

ABSTRACT

Public administration and management training (PAMT) in developing countries has expanded and diversified in the past three decades. Five preconditions have been identified as necessary to ensure the effectiveness of that training: training policies and management of institutions, the educational system, the stock of educated personnel, personnel policies and systems, and the administrative culture of governments. Few less-developed countries (LDCs) have formally adopted training policies, especially related to public enterprises. The network of PAMT institutions can be divided into four main categories: government-owned and managed institutions, autonomous institutions, university-related institutions, and management institutes or schools. The first three types usually implement a classroom approach; newer types of management training institutes devote increasing attention to research and consultancy. Evaluative studies have shown that the impact and effectiveness of training in LDCs have not matched the institutional capacity. Poor management has had adverse effects on the content and quality of training. Some recent innovations in PAMT include shifts in conceptual approaches and changes in the targets and methods of training. In three areas (public personnel policies and systems, training policy, and utilization of existing training infrastructure) new policy initiatives and actions by LDC governments are needed. (YLB)

Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made
from the original document.

ED240254

WORLD BANK STAFF WORKING PAPERS
Number 584

MANAGEMENT AND DEVELOPMENT SERIES
Number 11

Training for Public Administration and Management in Developing Countries

A Review

Samuel Paul

CE037913

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION
CENTER (ERIC)

☑ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

- Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official NIE position or policy.

The World Bank
Washington, D.C., U.S.A.

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS
MATERIAL IN MICROFICHE ONLY
HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

J. Feather

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES
INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

Copyright © 1983
The International Bank for Reconstruction
and Development / THE WORLD BANK
1818 H Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20433, U.S.A.

First printing July 1983
All rights reserved
Manufactured in the United States of America

This is a working document published informally by the World Bank. To present the results of research with the least possible delay, the typescript has not been prepared in accordance with the procedures appropriate to formal printed texts, and the World Bank accepts no responsibility for errors. The publication is supplied at a token charge to defray part of the cost of manufacture and distribution.

The views and interpretations in this document are those of the author(s) and should not be attributed to the World Bank, to its affiliated organizations, or to any individual acting on their behalf. Any maps used have been prepared solely for the convenience of the readers; the denominations used and the boundaries shown do not imply, on the part of the World Bank and its affiliates, any judgment on the legal status of any territory or any endorsement or acceptance of such boundaries.

The full range of World Bank publications is described in the *Catalog of World Bank Publications;* the continuing research program of the Bank is outlined in *World Bank Research Program: Abstracts of Current Studies.* Both booklets are updated annually; the most recent edition of each is available without charge from the Publications Distribution Unit of the Bank in Washington or from the European Office of the Bank, 66, avenue d'Iéna, 75116 Paris, France.

Samuel Paul is professor at the Indian Institute of Management, Ahmedabad and consultant to the World Bank.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Paul, Samuel, 1930-
Training for public administration and management in developing countries.

(World Bank staff working papers ; no. 584. Management and development subseries ; no. 11)
1. Public administration--Study and teaching--Developing countries. I. Title. II. Series: World Bank staff working papers ; no. 584. III. Series: World Bank staff working papers. Management and development subseries ; no. 11.
JF1338.A2P38 1983 350.1'5'091724 83-14554
ISBN 0-8213-0234-5

Abstract

This paper reports the results of a survey of the trends, developments, and problems in public administration and management training (PAMT) in developing countries. The survey is based largely on published information and is limited to the training of middle- and upper-level personnel in government, including those in public enterprises.

The patterns of growth and impact of PAMT in developing countries over the past thirty years are examined in the first part of the paper. The reasons for the rather limited impact of training in many countries, the lessons to be learned from the more successful training institutions, and recent innovations in training designs and methods are among other aspects highlighted in the paper. The major conclusions are:

(1) While the training infrastructure in the developing world has in recent decades expanded and diversified, its utilization and effectiveness have lagged behind significantly.

(2) Among the reasons for the poor utilization and limited impact of training are the inadequate training policies of governments, weaknesses in the design and management of training institutions, and failure to match faculty (trainers) resources, curricula, training materials and methodologies relevant to the emerging needs of developing countries.

(3) There is evidence of a growing interest in the formulation of national training policies in several countries in recent years. Experiments with newer and more relevant modes of training are being undertaken in different parts of the world, often with assistance from donor agencies.

The findings of the survey have important policy implications for improving the links between training and career development policies of governments, formulating national training policies and plans, utilizing training facilities more effectively, and establishing priorities for international assistance.

Acknowledgements

A number of persons and organizations have assisted me in the preparation of this paper. Participants at a seminar jointly organized by the World Development Report Core Team and the Education Department of the World Bank made valuable comments on the earlier version of this paper. The ILO, UNDP, UNDDA, Commonwealth Secretariat, USAID and the Ford Foundation furnished me a number of useful documents and reports. Among the many colleagues in the Bank who commented on the paper and assisted me at different stages in the preparation of this paper are Aklilu Habte, Pierre Landell-Mills, Selcuk Ozgediz, Abdun Noor, Mats Hultin, Arturo Israel, Peter Wright and Francis Letham. I am extremely grateful to all of them though the responsibility for any errors that remain is entirely mine.

Papers in the Management and Development Series

1. Agarwala, Ramgopal. Price Distortions and Growth in Developing Countries. World Bank Staff Working Paper no. 575.

2. Agarwala, Ramgopal. Planning in Developing Countries: Lessons of Experience. World Bank Staff Working Paper no. 576.

3. Cochrane, Glynn. Policies for Strengthening Local Government in Developing Countries. World Bank Staff Working Paper no. 582.

4. Gordon, David. Development Finance Companies, State and Privately Owned: A Review. World Bank Staff Working Paper no. 578.

5. Gould, David J., and Jose A. Amaro-Reyes. The Effects of Corruption on Administrative Performance: Illustrations from Developing Countries. World Bank Staff Working Paper no. 580.

6. Knight, Peter T. Economic Reform in Socialist Countries: The Experiences of China, Hungary, Romania, and Yugoslavia. World Bank Staff Working Paper no. 579.

7. Kubr, Milan, and John Wallace. Successes and Failures in Meeting the Management Challenge: Strategies and Their Implementation. World Bank Staff Working Paper no. 585.

8. Lethem, Francis J., and Lauren Cooper. Managing Project-Related Technical Assistance: The Lessons of Success. World Bank Staff Working Paper no. 586.

9. Ozgediz, Selcuk. Managing the Public Service in Developing Countries: Issues and Prospects. World Bank Staff Working Paper no. 583.

10. Paul, Samuel. Training for Public Administration and Management in Developing Countries: A Review. World Bank Staff Working Paper no. 584.

11. Rondinelli, Dennis A., John R. Nellis, and G. Shabbir Cheema. Decentralization in Developing Countries: A Review of Recent Experience. World Bank Staff Working Paper no. 581.

12. Shinohara, Miyohei, Toru Yanagihara, and Kwang Suk Kim. The Japanese and Korean Experiences in Managing Development. Ed. Ramgopal Agarwala. World Bank Staff Working Paper no. 574.

13. Shirley, Mary M. Managing State-Owned Enterprises. World Bank Staff Working Paper no. 577.

Foreword

This study is one in a series of World Bank Staff Working Papers devoted to issues of development management. Prepared as background papers for the World Development Report 1983, they provide an in-depth treatment of the subjects dealt with in Part II of the Report. The thirteen papers cover topics ranging from comprehensive surveys of management issues in different types of public sector institutions (for example, state-owned enterprises, the public service, and local government agencies) to broad overviews of such subjects as planning, management training, technical assistance, corruption, and decentralization.

The central concern underlying these papers is the search for greater efficiency in setting and pursuing development goals. The papers focus on the role of the state in this process, stress the importance of appropriate incentives, and assess the effectiveness of alternative institutional arrangements. They offer no general prescriptions, as the developing countries are too diverse--politically, culturally, and in economic resources--to allow the definition of a single strategy.

The papers draw extensively on the experiences of the World Bank and other international agencies. They were reviewed by a wide range of readership from developing and developed countries inside and outside the Bank. They were edited by Victoria Macintyre. Rhoda Blade-Charest, Banjonglak Duangrat, Jaunianne Fawkes, and Carlina Jones prepared the manuscripts for publication.

I hope that these studies will be useful to practitioners and academicians of development management around the world.

Pierre Landell-Mills
Staff Director
World Development Report 1983

Contents

Page No.

Summary 1

I. Introduction 7

II. Evolution and Growth of PAMT 18

III. Training Policies 30

IV. Training Institutions: Their Structure and Programs 41

V. Evaluation of Training 52

VI. Design and Management of Training Institutions 67

VII. Recent Developments in Training 74

VIII. Conclusions and Policy Implications 85

Appendix INTAN of Malaysia: A Case of Successful Training Strategy 100

Glossary

AIM : Asian Institute of Management, Manila
AIPA : Autonomous Institutes of Public Administration
APDAC : Asian and Pacific Development Administration Centre
ASC : Administrative Staff College
CAFRAD : African Training and Research Center in Administration for Development, Tangiers
CARICAD : Caribbean Center for Development Administration
CLAD : Latin American Center for Public Administration
CPA : Central Personnel Authority
CA : Commonwealth Secretariat, London
CSA : Civil Service Academy
ECA : Economic Commission for Africa (United Nations)
EDI : Economic Development Institute of the World Bank
ENA : Ecole Nationale d'Administration (National School of Administration)
ESAMI : East and Southern African Management Institute, Arusha
IASIA : International Association of Schools and Institutes of Administration
ICAP : Central American Institute of Public Administration
IIMA : Indian Institute of Management, Ahmedabad
INCAE : Central American Institute of Business Administration
INTAN : Instituit Tadbiran Awam Negara (National Institute of Public Administration), Malaysia
IST : In-service Training
KIA : Kenya Institute of Administration
PAMT : Public Administration and management Training
PAID : Pan-African Institute for Development
PET : Pre-entry training
PIP : Performance improvement programming
PRT : Project-related training
R & D : Research and development
SD : Self-development
UDA : University Departments of Administration
UNDDA : United Nations Division of Development Administration

SUMMARY

Public management training in developing countries has expanded and diversified considerably in the past three decades. Most countries had limited training facilities before 1950. Since then, a large number of new institutions has been established in the developing world, initially with the active support of aid donors.

International surveys on the pattern of growth of training institutions show that the number of training institutions has increased fourfold (from 70 to 280) during the past two decades. The number of public servants who have been trained has increased fivefold or more in such countries as India, Malaysia, and the Philippines during this period.

Among aid agencies, such as the United Nations, the United States Government, and Ford Foundation, nearly $250 million have been spent for creating, or upgrading, public administration training institutions during 1951-62. Training assistance to developing countries by the United Nations in 1981 alone amounted to $70 million; this included 11,500 overseas training fellowships. The World Bank's expenditures on project-related spending has increased dramatically from $38 million in 1976 to $187 million in 1981.

In recent years, newer types of institutions have emerged to augment the supply of training programs. In addition to civil service academies, university departments, schools, and autonomous institutes of administration, administrative staff colleges, management institutes, sectoral training centers, project-related training by donors, and regional or intergovernmental institutions have joined the network, each in response to newly emerging problems and needs. Five regional and intergovernmental institutions are in operation today, three under UN auspices. However, the first two categories still constitute the dominant elements in the network.

The major contribution of governmental and university training institutions has been in the area of pre-entry training. Though in-service training has expanded in recent years, its coverage in terms of personnel training remains small. Both pre-entry and in-service training are heavily biased in favor of the central administrative cadres. Even so, among civil servants, only one out of seven in Turkey and one out of five in India would

receive some in-service training in their entire career. Training of lower-level personnel tends to receive lower priority in the process. There is, thus, evidence of a skewed distribution of training opportunities and experiences in developing countries. Interestingly enough, senior-level administrators seldom undergo training within their own countries. Their lack of exposure to new administrative practices and management concepts has been reported to be a barrier to the proper use of the trained personnel working under them.

Limited Impact of Training

Most evaluation studies of training institutions are agreed that the impact has fallen far short of expectations both in terms of the numbers of personnel trained as well as in the effective utilization of resources. Not more than 5-10% of public servants in most developing countries are likely to receive training in any given year; this contrasts with nearly 25% in developed countries such as the U.S. and Japan. Moreover, the expansion of training infrastructure has not been matched by an effective utilization of the facilities and a balanced distribution of training opportunities. Even the impact of project-related training by donor agencies has been less than optimal because in many cases a short-term view of training was adopted and adequate care was not taken to plan and monitor this activity. The inability of imported training models to adapt to local needs and conditions has certainly contributed to this problem.

The limited impact of public management training can be attributed to three important factors:

(1) Absence of, or inadequacies in, training policies. Very few countries have comprehensive training policies which offer guidelines on training needs assessment, design and planning of training programs, and monitoring and evaluation of training. Training costs are seldom planned and monitored.

The trends in this area seem to indicate a growing interest in the development of training policies, especially among the countries of Africa. International exchange of ideas and experiences on policy formulation have increased in recent years. In Asia, the experience of a few countries, which have adopted training policies, shows that the hardest task is the integration of training policy with the broader personnel policies of government. However, adoption of a training policy is no guarantee that it will be implemented. The commitment of both political and bureaucratic leadership is an essential condition for implementation. Furthermore, without policy capabilities and skills within government, tasks such as needs assessment, evaluation, and monitoring will not be accomplished even if commitment to policy exists.

(2)Problems in the design and management of training institutions. These problems have been recognized in a number of country evaluation reports. The experience of the more successful institutions, such as the Indian Institute of Management, Ahmedabad and the National Institute of Administration (INTAN), Malaysia shows that a mix of institutional features is essential to achieve a high level of performance. Focus on a single factor, such as organization structure or locating the institution within the President's office, may not by itself lead to better performance. Among the relatively well managed institutions, there is a mix of institutional features which permit effective autonomy to plan and adapt institutional strategies. Other features include a strong focus on the multiple but related tasks of training; research and consultancy; close linkages with client groups; a critical size of faculty and investment in their development; a participatory style of decision making; and leadership with stability.

There are several entry points available to governments to improve the management of their institutions. The choice of a suitable leader, external reviews to probe performance problems, and strengthening faculty development are examples of such interventions. Clearly, a careful situational analysis must precede the choice of the entry point.

(3) Mismatch of programs, curricula, and methods. The mix of training activities organized by the different categories of institutions varies a great deal. Some are concerned chiefly with pre-entry training, whereas others concentrate on in-service training. Some cater to the needs of governments, others meet both public and private sector needs. Their programs cover general administration as well as functional and specialized aspects of administration. Recent developments in training and the major problems being faced by training institutions are summarized below.

Over the years, as the development tasks and problems of countries have changed, the focus of training has also changed to cope with new needs. A strategy adopted by some countries is to widen the network of institutions to meet their diverse training needs. Thus, management institutes have begun to play a useful role in public service training. New sectoral training centers have emerged in some countries. However, it is the government's own institutions and university departments and schools which have been least able to adapt and respond to these new needs. In many countries, their curricula, training materials, and methods have virtually remained unchanged over long periods. The lecture method, for example, is still widely prevalent and very little research and development work has been done to develop indigenous training materials and experiment with new modes and methods of training. In rural development, the adoption of new development strategies has led to a variety of training experiments, such as the action-learning approach; this is a promising approach to training, though it is too early to judge its long-term impact on performance.

Policy Implications

If training is to be effective, developing country governments must intervene in their personnel policies to create strong linkages between career development plans and training of personnel, and improve the career prospects of trainers themselves. There is a need to link training to performance appraisal systems and promotion policies to motivate public servants to make better use of training. At the national level, monitoring of training can be strengthened and at the regional level, support can be extended to regional cooperation in training. Perhaps, a nodal agency can be established within the government to be responsible for these tasks.

Governments which do not have formal training policies need to evolve guidelines to develop internal capabilities. The guidelines must cover the objectives and types of training that the government will support the training needs of government agencies and public enterprises, the design and preparation of a training plan based on needs assessment and resource availability, and the financing of training. In addition, the guidelines must take into account the monitoring and evaluation of training with special emphasis on linkages with career development and the roles and responsibilities of different agencies in performing the various tasks.

While there is a need to establish new institutions where serious training gaps exist, a more effective utilization of the existing facilities could lead to significant gains at little extra cost. Governments could reallocate resources within the existing framework, for example, by reducing long-duration pre-entry training programs and increasing in-service training, and by mobilizing nongovernmental institutions to participate actively in such training. At the same time, barriers to training effectiveness can be reduced by strengthening research and development for training. The nodal agency can play a key role in this effort by coordinating the assessment of training needs by different agencies, financing the development of new program designs and training materials, and supporting the development of faculty staff on a long-term basis for the public service and public enterprises. Governments can also help in the better management of existing institutions by choosing very carefully leaders, who would head them, and by ensuring these leaders a reasonable degree of stability and autonomy to plan and adapt institutional strategies, and strengthening their linkages with client organizations.

International assistance can play a useful role in filling many gaps in training activities. For example, analysis of the World Bank's project-related training could yield useful insights on how to organize this training component and which of the better approaches can usefully be transferred. The training designs and materials used in one project may have relevance for others. International assistance could play a useful role in several areas:

- Disseminating knowledge about better personnel policies, systems, and practices, and the lessons of institutional development, based not only on the experience of developed countries, but of developing countries which have introduced innovations in this field. Regional institutions can play a leading role in dissemination process.
- Meeting training gaps in specialized areas such as financial management and supervisory training and assisting in the introduction of new systems in government.
- Giving priority to the training of trainers in developing countries.
- Linking project-related training with local institutions.

- Supporting faculty development, and improving training materials and methods, especially through regional cooperation for the benefit of the smaller, developing countries.

I. INTRODUCTION

Training has long been recognized as an important instrument of human resource development. Technical assistance programs financed by the developed countries and multilateral development agencies have devoted considerable attention and resources to the task of strengthening and upgrading the training capacities of the less developed countries (LDCs). International assistance to LDCs in the field of training (technical, administrative, and other types) amounted to $800 million in 1980 compared with about $50 million in 1960.1/ It is estimated that assistance for public administration and training accounted for $20 million in 1960 and $80 million in 1980. Over the past three decades, governments of LDCs have invested heavily in the establishment of a wide variety of educational and training facilities with and without foreign assistance. The World Bank has estimated that the total public expenditure on education by all LDCs combined has risen from $9 billion in 1960 (2.4% of their collective GNP) to $38 billion in 1976 (4% of their GNP).2/

Training in public administration stands out as one aspect of manpower development which was accorded a special place in the early years of technical assistance programs. Institutions for the training of public servants were set up in many LDCs and foreign experts assisted in their early planning and management. Over 7,000 public servants and potential trainers from LDCs were sent for abroad training in the 1950s as part of a strategy to stengthen the institutional capacities of these countries to manage their new programs for development.3/ Though the resources for this form of technical assistance seem to have declined over the past decade, training facilities and activities in LDCs have, on the whole, continued to grow.

While there have been isolated efforts to evaluate the impact of specific training institutions and programs, it is fair to say that no comprehensive survey of the growth and impact of public service training in LDCs has been attempted by anyone so far.4/ The growing concern about management as a constraint on development in recent years has once again focused attention on the need to strengthen the institutional capacity of LDCs in public service training. Since public service training is an ongoing activity, it is important to analyze the evidence and assess the strengths and weaknesses of the existing training strategies and institutional arrangements before designing new ones.

Objectives and Scope of Study

Public service training usually refers to the training of all categories of personnel employed by a government. Though the development of all types of personnel is important, our focus will be on the training of only one category of public servants, viz. those who have managerial and administrative responsibilities. Their training needs and resource requirements differ in important ways from those of technical personnel who perform highly spedialized functions and clerical personnel at lower levels who perform routine functions, but do not supervize the work of other public servants. As their careers develop, it often happens that specialists are also called upon to play managerial roles. This explains the growing trend in many countries to blend technical and managerial functions during in-service trianing.5/

The terms "administration" and "management" are sometimes used interchangeably. Nevertheless, they do have different connotations. In general, management is seen as a positive, opportunity seeking, and change-oriented concept whereas administration connotes a greater degree of passivity and orientation towards the status quo. According to Kenneth Rothwell:6/

> "Administration is usually thought of as accepting goals from outside the system, as depending upon resources from other systems and being instructed in the use of means. Management, on the other hand, is usually though of as developing goals within the system, using resources over which the sytem has control, and being free in the use of means. Receiving its authority from outside (or above) and referring its decisions and results elsewhere, administration is self-contained and acts as principal rather than as agent".6/

tended to become less sharp in the public sector because over the years, governments have increasingly undertaken development programs and projects. There is a growing awareness that public managers responsible for development tasks must be active and able to influence change even though they are subject to external policy constraints. Public administration is no longer concerned solely with "maintenance" and "implementation", but also with the formulation of goals in the context of given environments. The growing use of the term "public management" underscores the view of the public administrator as a manager with an entrepreneurial and decisionmaking role.

The importance of this rôle, of course, tends to vary with the level of the public servant in government. It is common practice to categorize managers by senior, middle, and low levels according to the degree of their involvement in the formulation and implementation of policy. A senior level manager responsible for strategic decisions and target setting is more concerned with the goal setting process and monitoring of performance of tasks than with the actual implementation of tasks in the field. The permanent secretary of a ministry or the head of a national agricultural program, for example, tends to play this role in a developing country. The middle-level manager is more concerned with the implementation of his program and the control of specific activities than with pollicy formulation. A regional manager in a national program or a district officer would fall into this category. A low level manager is one whose primary preoccupation is with implementation and supervision of work in a limited functional or geographical area, for example, a village-level health supervisor. The role of the public administrator/manager in influencing goals and policies increases with his level in the organization. There is a continuum rather than a dichotomy between policy and administration.

Public servants, irrespective of their levels in the hierarchy, must possess the conceptual knowledge, skills and attitudes relevant to the performance of their jobs. Training refers to the process of developing or augmenting such knowledge, skills and attitudes in a person with a view to enabling him to apply them in his work situation. In the case of a factory worker, training could be defined narrowly in terms of specific operational skills, such as weaving, machining, and so on. In the public sector, however, the requirements of a person's job may be such that the objectives of training have to be more broadly defined. It is well known, for example, that in military training strengthening the patriotic and ideological commitment of officers is an important objective. In the corporate world, managers are imparted not only technical skills, but also an appreciation of the corporate ideology and skills in team work.

Similarly, administrative training should not be viewed as a purely technocratic exercise. Its objectives may include, for example, the creation of a commitment in public servants to the national goals and values, and an understanding of the complexity of the national environment to which the specific skills learned must be adapted. The complexity of training objectives tends to increase with the levels of public servants for whom training is to be organized. While some of these objectives can be met through on-the-job training, more often than not, formal training away from the job may also become necessary. As the acquisition of knowledge and skills become more general purpose and long term in nature, we tend to call it education rather than training. However, even if the educational preparation of a public servant is adequate at the time of his entry into government service, training may still be required to induct and adapt him to his new job, and upgrade his skills at different stages in his career to match his changing task requirements.

In both the public and private sectors, it is possible to distinguish between the institutional arrangements for the education and training of managers. Educational programs are in both cases long term (generally 1-4 years) and prepare students for a degree of diploma. Generally, universities and other autonomous bodies offer such educational facilities. While the same set of institutions may offer training programs for practitioners also, a good part of such training is organized by special institutions established as an integral part of the government. The tendency to set up such captive training facilities is weaker in the private sector as the limited size and resources of many firms make it an uneconomical proposition.

Traditionally, public administration training has focussed on the political, legal and organizational environment of the government, and the development of skills in the functional aspects of administration such as budgeting and accounting, personnel, and organization and methods. General training that covers all these functions as well as specialized courses on any of them are treated as public administration training. In recent years, with the advent of development planning in many LDCs, courses on project appraisal and management have been added to these traditional subjects. Apart from the use of specialized tools and technologies, theories of organization, largely based on concepts and applications of behavioral sciences, are also found in the training curricula. Given the assumption that policy is outside the purview of the administrator, the dominant tradition in this field of training has emphasized the instrumental role of administrators.

Management training for enterprises has also given considerable attention to the firm's environment and the application of tools and techniques to the functional aspects of enterprise management such as marketing, finance, production, personnel and industrial relations, and planning and control. The application of economics, mathematics and behavioral sciences to these functional areas has been a major development in management education and training in recent years. Two other features of the management field, however, have no counterpart in public administration. First, enterprise (business) policy is a proper subject of analysis in management and provides an integrative framework to pull together specialized functions such as marketing, finance, and production. This framework relates enterprise goals to its environment and offers a conceptual basis for integrating the diverse functions referred to above. Second, the focus of the subject is very much on the decisionmaker. Application of knowledge to problem solving has, therefore, been a strong tradition in management with its implications for learning (training) methodologies. In contrast, an integrative framework has been missing in the education for public administration, and training methodologies do not have a strong problem solving and decisionmaking orientation.7/

There are two types of organizations which are known for their strong tradition in training. In all parts of the world, the military is reputed for its emphasis on the systematic training of all its personnel at different stages in their careers. Their training inputs include not only technical, but also administrative and mangerial components. Similarly, business enterprises, especially multinational corporations, are well known for their emphasis on training for all categories of their employees.8/ Here again, personnel policies support the training function through the career development and performance evaluation processes. Chandler's recent study has claimed that the significant expansion in the size and decentralization of United States multinationals was greatly facilitated by the increased use of professionally trained managers.9/ The growing demand for formal management training in the United States, has been attributed to this phenomenon. According to this study, modern business schools were central to the professionalization of management in the large multi-unit enterprises. In the military as well as business, it is significant that the dominant tasks of performance are pretty strong - the battlefield in one case, and the market place in the other. The serious attention to formal training given by both types of organization may not therefore be entirely accidental!

The focus of this study, however, is not on training in the military and the private sector. It will concentrate instead on training for those categories of public servants in developing countries who play administrative and managerial roles in their organizations. The term "public administration and management training" (PAMT) is used to refer to this activity. The study will focus on all formal training activities designed to strengthen the knowledge and skills and influence the behavior and attitudes of middle- and senior-level public servants in government with a view to improving their task performance.

Most of the PAMT activities found in LDCs today may be classified into four categories: (a) pre-entry training (PET), (b) in-service training (IST), (c) project-related training (PRT), and (d) self-development (SD). PET refers to training offered to persons prior to their formal entry into the public service. In some cases, PET may follow immediately after their recruitment but before they are placed in their first job. Examples of PET are formal courses in public administration or management organized by universities and foundations and courses organized by government training centers for probationers recruited into the service. In-service training (IST) refers to the training given to persons at different stages in their careers after they have been inducted into the service. Examples are mid-career management development programs at home or abroad, on-the-job training at different stages in a person's career, and other specialized short-term training programs. The target groups of both PET and IST are all public servants, though distinctions may be made between the levels and services to which they belong. Thus, PET may be organized for the elite cadres separately. IST may be organized for those who have completed, say, ten years of service. Project-related training (PRT), on the other hand, focuses on the training requirements of all personnel in a given development project. Distinction between levels here is secondary. Self-development (SD) refers to organized efforts to support individual training through the facilities available outside the government training system. Thus, public servants may be encouraged to undergo specialized training in certain useful subjects at a university. Study leave and other incentives may be offered by government to motivate employees to engage in SD. The main features of the different categories of training are summarized in Table 1.1.

Because training is a vast field, the paper will specify the preconditions for training effectiveness in the developing countries from a national perspective. It will seek answers to a variety of questions. How has public administration and management training evolved over the years? What patterns and indicators of growth in terms of inputs and outputs can be discerned from published data? Do governments have training policies for their public service? How do institutions perform their training function? What are their major activities and programs? What is the impact and effectiveness of PAMT? What are the lessons to be learned from institutions that have performed relatively well? Do they offer any innovative approaches and modes of training? The conclusions and policy implications of this state-of-the-art survey will also be summarized.

A major limitation of this study is its exclusive reliance on published information. Clearly, much valuable, unpublished data are available with governments and donor agencies, but they are inaccessible. Readers are, therefore, advised to bear in mind this limitation while interpreting the findings of this paper.

Effectiveness of Training: The Preconditions

Training has often been prescribed as a panacea for the ills of developing countries. In the heyday of technical assistance during the 1950s, there was a widely held belief that the performance of poor countries could be significantly improved by helping their citizens to absorb the technologies and skills developed in the West. Training was identified as the prime instrument in the transfer process and this is turn provided the rationale for foreign aid to strengthen PAMT facilities in a wide range of countries. The slow pace of progress and unexpected barriers to growth experienced by the third world in subsequent years seem to have tempered these over-optimistic expectations and led several international agencies to cut back on their allocations for public

Table 1.1

Features of Different Types of Training

Category	Nature and Scope	Duration
Pre-entry training (PET)	Training given to new entrants either prior to recruitment or during probation prior to first job assignment. Focus on induction/subjects relevant to the general functions of administration. Usually a combination of classroom training and field work/attachments.	Generally long term - 6 months to 3 years.
In-service training (IST)	Training provided after entry into the service at different stages in a public servant's career. Covers both general administration/management training and functional/specialized training.	Generally short term - a few days to 6 months.
Project related training (PRT)	Training offered to different categories of personnel in a development project. Includes both technical and managerial training. Organized usually by donors.	Generally short term - a few days to a few months or a year depending upon project needs.
Self Development (SD)	Training on a part-time or full-time basis at the initiative of a public servant, but with the formal support/approval of the government, using facilities outside of government.	Generally long term. Duration will depend on the qualification to be acquired.

administration training. There is probably a greater awareness today that training must be viewed as part of a set of complex, inter-related variables which together determine the pace of development.

At the micro level, the performance of an individual is jointly influenced by his ability and motivation. Even if a person scores high on ability, but is low on motivation, his performance will be lower than will be the case otherwise. The primary contribution of training is in improving ability. It cannot do a great deal to improve an individual's motivation which depends on other factors such as compensation, working conditions, and personality characteristics. Thus, training influences performance through the ability factor and plays only a partial role in determining the overall level of an individuals's performance.

There is clearly a relationship between the role of training at the micro and macro levels. To the extent training can be used to augment the abilities of the citizenry, it might help improve the aggregate performance of the country's economy.

The supply of training as an input, however, is no guarantee that it will be effectively utilized at the macro level. This is particularly true of public service training. From a policy standpoint, it is important, therefore, to identify the preconditions necessary to ensure the effectiveness of training; the five preconditions are discussed below.

(1) Training Policies and Management of Institutions. A national policy on training and on the design and management is a prerequisite for effective training. When training is organized haphazardly, and training concepts, content, and methodologies are not properly adapted to the local environment, both training and the training institutions usually fail to make the impact expected of them.

(2) The Education System. The training system can only build on what the education system can offer; the existence of a sound education system that can back up the training system is essential. When the educational foundation of the young is weak or inappropriate to the country's needs, training becomes an uphill task. To some extent, the mismatch may be due to inadequate manpower planning by the government, which may have neglected the development of certain categories of manpower by the education system.

(3) The Stock of Educated Manpower. A reasonably good supply of educated manpower is a necessary precondition for PAMT effectiveness of training. Some LDCs are plagued by a general shortage of educated manpower. This is not necessarily a problem of the education system alone. Demographic factors as well as past policies of development may have led to a condition of continuing manpower shortage which makes it difficult for the public service to attract an adequate supply of educated manpower. Under these conditions, competition for trained manpower becomes intense and a rapid turnover or depletion of personnel in the public sector renders training less effective.

(4) Personnel Policies and Systems. Training is unlikely to be effective as long as the personnel policies and systems of the government do not support this activity. For example, if training is not integrated with the career development plans of public servants and systems for performance evaluation, it is unlikely that "affective demand" for training will be created. The reluctance of ministries to sponsor people for training and the lack of motivation on the part of public servants to take advantage of training opportunities could largely be attributed to this factor.

(5) The Administrative Culture of Governments. For PAMT to be effective, it requires an administrative system that is performance oriented in its patterns of authority and communication, attitudes to work, and values. Every government has an administrative culture which is the combined outcome of informal work socialization and the interaction of complex administrative structures over a long period of time.10/ Several studies of training in industry have documented the decisive influence of "organizational climate" on training effectiveness.11/ While limited tools and techniques of management can be transferred with relative ease through training, without major changes in its administrative culture, it is difficult to make PAMT an effective input for development. In a sense, it is the weight of this broader nonresult oriented administrative culture which inhibits the realignment of personnel policies in many LDC governments.

An analysis of these five preconditions shows that some of them influence training effectiveness from the supply side whereas others operate on the demand side. The first three variables - namely, policies for the management of training, the education system, and the stock of educated manpower - contribute to effectiveness by improving the supply of training. The reference here is not merely to the quantitative aspect of supply, but more importantly to its qualitative dimensions. A more appropriate training strategy, for example, leads qualitatively to better training. On the other side, personnel policies and administrative culture are variables which promote effectiveness by stimulating a more genuine demand for training. Thus, when career development linkages with training are strong, there is a greater incentive on the part of public servants to respond to and internalize training inputs. When the administrative culture is performance oriented, a ministry will demand more training inputs for its personnel if this helps in improving its performance. Training effectiveness is optimized only when both sets of preconditions are satisfied. Even if the preconditions for improving the supply side are met while those on the demand side are ignored, the net result will be suboptimal. The demand pull which would have improved effectiveness is absent in this case. Similarly, if personnel policies are better realigned, but training strategies are ignored, then again, the result will be less than optimal as the supply push which would have improved effectiveness will remain weak.

In brief, attention must be given to the preconditions on both supply and demand sides in order to optimize training effectiveness. It is their combined support that improves the "fit" between the training needs of government and the actual training services offered. The prescription to expand training activities without paying attention to these preconditions betrays a lack of understanding of the complementarity between the two. More training does not necessarily lead to better or more effective training. Even as they take steps to strengthen PAMT activities, governments ought to review their policies which have a bearing on the different preconditions discussed above. The policy implications of these preconditions will be discussed in the following chapters.

II. EVOLUTION AND GROWTH OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION AND MANAGEMENT TRAINING

Public administration and management training in developing countries is essentially a post-World War II phenomenon. The number and variety of training institutions expanded significantly after the war when many countries in Asia and Africa became independent. This is not to imply that training activities were non-existent in their pre-independence days. In Latin American countries, which had won their independence long before most other developing countries, public service training, though haphazard, had existed for many years. Legal training was the dominant influence on their training system which borrowed heavily from the French tradition.12/ In South Asia, the British tradition of generalist training had left its mark even in the colonial days. British as well as Indian officers who joined the civil service were given education in selected British universities and special colleges set up for this purpose in then undivided India. In Africa, facilities for training administrators and managers were more or less nonexistent in the colonial days as such positions were filled almost exclusively by expatriates. Taking LDCs as a whole, training infrastructure was extremely limited in scope and rudimentary in nature until three decades ago. Whatever facilities existed, were a reflection of the systems and practices of the colonial governments which ruled or influenced them.13/

Technical Assistance for Institution Building

The 1950s saw a remarkable shift in the approaches and attitudes towards training in many LDCs. The rapid expansion of the roles and functions of government into new economic and social fields led to a much sharper focus on training. A United Nations Special Committee on Public Administration Problems in 1951 noted the scarcity of highly trained public servants and advocated further study of the availability of "qualified personnel at the intermediate and higher levels".14/ The new upsurge of interest in training was soon reflected in the very first UN technical assistance program which led to the establishment in the 1950s of new institutes of administration in Argentina, Brazil, Burma, Colombia, El Salvador, Ethiopia and Turkey. An even more significant initiative came during the same period from the U.S. technical assistance program. Several projects for establishing new training institutions in Latin America and Asia were completed in the 1950s under this program. New institutions with U.S. assistance were set up in Brazil, El Salvador, Ecuador, Republic of Korea, Mexico, Pakistan, Peru, the Philippines, Thailand and Vietnam during this period.15/ At about the same time, in a dozen or more countries, the French government assisted in the establishment of new training institutions patterned after the French Ecole Nationale d'Administration.16/ Algeria, Cameroon, Central African Republic, Chad, Ivory Coast, Mali, Morocco, Niger, Senegal, Togo, Tunisia and Upper Volta were among the countries in Africa where such institutions were established in the late 1950s and early 1960s. Among the American foundations, the Ford Foundation spent over $23 million in support of "development planning and management" during 1955-59. This accounted for 30% of the foundation's total budget and led to the establishment of public administration institutes in several countries with major involvements in Egypt, India, Indonesia and Pakistan.17/ The UN, the U.S. Agency for International Development (USAID) and Ford Foundation together are estimated to have spent about $250 million in support of institution building in the third world for public administration and trained over 7,000 persons during the period 1951-62. This new wave of institution building in public administration in the 1950s was aided by both bilateral and multilateral technical assistance programs which viewed training as a critical ingredient in the development process.

An unusual constellation of factors triggered the boom in training infrastructure building in LDCs in the 1950s. First, the political independence won by a large number of countries and the urgent need to indigenize and modernize their civil service generated a strong demand for, or at least heightened their receptivity to, training. Second, the emergence of the concept of technical assistance supported by important bilateral and multilateral development agencies provided a timely vehicle to respond to this need. Third, the optimism and conviction of professional opinion as well as political leadership during this period was that transfer of knowledge and skills from developed countries through training is a valid approach to the development of LDCs and, therefore, facilitated the large-scale allocation of resources in support of PAMT.

By the end of the 1960s, however, this momentum of institution building for PAMT with international support had begun to decelerate. USAID, for example, took a decision in the mid-1960s to cut back on public administration assistance to LDCs in the belief that there was no immediate pay-off in terms of improved development performance. USAID officials found such assistance "difficult, sensitive and uncertain".18/ It was felt that development administration needed different approaches and tools from what the U.S. based public administration models had to offer; the Ford Foundation came to similar conclusions. So, the share of public management related programs in the foundation's budget declined from 30% in 1955-59 to 19% in 1970-74. Nevertheless, many donors increased their project-related training (PRT) to LDCs in the 1970s with a strong component of management training in their development projects. For example, the World Bank's PRT has increased from $67.2 million in 1976 to $186.8 million in 1981.19/ The assistance of the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) to public administration also increased from $38 million in 1972-76 to $60 million in 1977-81.20/

Overseas training of LDC personnel constitutes an important form of donor assistance. Member countries of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), which account for the bulk of bilateral foreign assistance, currently spend nearly $500 million per year on training assistance to LDCs; a major part of this amount is spent on training fellowships abroad.21/ The number of fellowships has increased from 82,500 in 1970 to 93,500 in 1978 and 110,000 in 1979. Of the 93,500 training fellowships offered in 1978, 14,000 or nearly 15% of the grants were in the field of public administration.22/ The major trends and problems in this area are the following: First, though the overall number of fellowships offered by the OECD group has increased between 1970 and 1978, the fellowship grants in public administration has declined by nearly 15%. There is thus some evidence that the use of overseas training to strengthen public administration is receiving lower priority than before. Second, requests for training grants from LDCs appear to favor senior-level personnel. Middle-level personnel, whose shortage is severe in many African countries, do not receive the attention they deserve. Women too have received only a negligible number of training grants. Third, there has been a growing tendency on the part of donors and LDCs to organize training for the grantees in their own countries. Use of training fellowships in the home country as a percent of total fellowships has increased from 5% to 13% between 1970 and 1979. Training abroad, however, continues to be the dominant feature of donor assistance by way of fellowships.

Expansion of Training Infrastructure in the 1970s

Quantitative indicators of the growth and significance of PAMT in LDCs are difficult to assemble, for several reasons. First of all, training is not a standardized activity with uniform and measurable inputs and outputs. Simple indicators such as number of courses, size of budgets, and number of trainees do not adequately reflect either the quality dimension or the variations in the input-output relationships among the different types of training. Second, since many institutions are engaged in multiple activities (not merely training), it becomes difficult to allocate inputs and outputs which are jointly utilized or generated. Third, since training is an internal activity, of interest mainly to public servants, public demand for the dissemination of training data is limited. Governments are therefore under no great pressure to undertake detailed studies or publish relevant information on the progress of PAMT. Consquently, data on training are generally scanty and aggregate indicators of its progress and performance virtually nonexistent. In view of this data problem, I have pulled together the partial evidence that is available on some dimensions of training and experiences of selected countries.

The institutional capacities of LDCs as a whole have increased significantly over the past three decades if the increase in the number of training institutions is used as an index. The 1980 Directory of Management and Administrative institutes prepared by the International Labour Office (ILO), lists 236 PAMT institutions in 91 countries; the International Association of Schools and Institutes of Administration (IASIA) survey found 276 public administration training institutes and schools presently in operation in 91 countries.[23,24] The major difference between the two lists is that IASIA includes a larger number of university departments which claim to be engaged in training activities; it is more comprehensive than that of ILC whose primary concern is with general management training. However, even the IASIA list must be regarded as an underestimate as it does not report most of the ministry/departmental training centers set up by LDC governments. These training centers generally tend to be more specialized sectorally or otherwise, but do offer PAMT to some extent.

Both the ILO and IASIA estimates point to a significant expansion of PAMT facilities in LDCs - some 200 new institutions over a 20-year period. This is corroborated by a recent survey of 118 institutions around the world which showed that nearly 85% of them were founded less than 30 years ago.25/ For example, in Pakistan, six new institutions were established by the government since independence. These are the Academy of Administrative Training, the Pakistan Academy for Rural Development, Secretariat Training Institute, two National Institutes of Public Administration and the Pakistan Administrative Staff College. In addition, two universities have established departments of administrative studies. The first three among these institutions are engaged in probationers' training and supervisory training whereas the last three provide training for upper levels of the civil service. In another Asian country, the Philippines, an Institute of Public Administration was established in 1953 as part of the University of the Philippines. The Philippine Executive Academy was set up within the same University in 1963. Two more institutions, the Civil Service Academy and the Development Academy of the Philippines, were set up as part of the Government in the 1970s to meet the administrative training needs of the lower and upper levels of public servants respectively. The University Institute's primary focus was on pre-service degree programs.

In Nigeria, there was only one institute of administration before independence (at Zaria) that was engaged in training for the northern regional administrative service. The Government of Nigeria had no central training institution of its own. It was in the 1970s that two new federal institutions, the Centre for Management Development and the Administrative Staff College for senior-level training, were established. In addition, two university departments of administration were also created. Brazil, on the other hand, established four new institutions in the 1950s. Of these, two were autonomous institutions and the rest were affiliated to universities. Senegal established five new training centers or insitutions for administration in the 1960s; four of these were under government auspices and one was part of a university. Most of the expansion in the infrastructure for training seems to have taken place in the larger LDCs; they established multiple training institutions during this period, whereas smaller countries typically had only a single training institution.

The number of persons trained in these new institutions has increased significantly in recent years. In Malaysia, the number of persons trained increased from 1,000 in 1960 to 9,000 in 1980; in India, it was 1,500 and 7,000 respectively (for the federal government only). In Bangladesh, on the average, over 5,000 public servants were trained per year in the mid-1970s. In Nigeria, 8,500 persons from the public and private sectors underwent management training in 1976-77. In the Philippines, a single new program started in 1972 trained nearly 20,000 middle level administrators during a period of five years.

This steady expansion of institutional training capacity in LDCs may seem unusual in view of the declining trend in the support of donor agencies noted in the preceding pages. The explanation lies in the fact that LDC governments financed an increasing share of the institution-building costs over the years, even as international assistance began to shrink. In the heyday of technical assistance for public administration (1950-62), the United Nations, USAID, and the Ford Foundation had assisted in the establishment of 27, 45, and 7 training institutions respectively in over 70 countries.26/ The vast majority of new institutions set up after this period came into being without any significant dependence on foreign aid. International assistance, however, continues for the smaller and poorer LDCs.

Developed Country Experiences

The United States has long led the world in public administration and management training in terms both of the official support given to such training by government and industry and the vast network of educational and training institutions engaged in this activity. The annual expenditure on training in the United States was estimated at $10 billion in the 1960s.27/ American universities have offered pre-entry programs for the public service since the 1920s, and their graduates have risen to eminent positions in various government departments in the U.S.28/ Governments at the national and state levels have established their own training centers to conduct in-service training (IST) for their personnel ranging from the training of clerks to those of officials in the highest professional and administrative echelons. In relative terms, the involvement of U. S. universities in IST for government has been much less significant than in pre-entry training (PET). At the university level, in recent years the trend has been to move away from training techniques toward greater emphasis on policy and program planning and analysis. Within the U. S. Government, the focus on IST has been further strengthened by the passing of the Government Employees Training Act in 1958 which specified Government's training policy and increased the flexibility and financial support for training. It is estimated that one out of four U.S. federal employees benefit from some form of formal training at government expense every year, and that one-third of the total training budget is devoted to PAMT.29/

Public service training in European countries has also undergone significant changes since World War II. In Britain, the Administrative Staff College at Henley and universities, such as Manchester, have been active in the training of civil servants for many years, though in terms of the numbers trained, their coverage has not been extensive. On the whole, British universities have not been as involved in PET for the government as their American counterparts. In Britain, which has traditionally believed in generalist education for its civil servants, a major landmark was the establishment of a Civil Service College in 1970 on the recommendation of the Fulton Committee.30/ The purpose of this new training and research institution was to cope with the weaknesses arising out of generalist education by providing in-service training in administration and management to public servants at middle and higher levels, and to undertake research and consultancy work relevant to public administration.

In France, training is strongly oriented to the development of technocratic elites who are influential in both the public and private sectors. The Government of France is well known for its systematic approach to the training of public servants, especially at the entry level. The new French model, known as the Grand Ecoles type of training, is the basis for access to key positions in the administration and for career promotion. The National School of Administration (ENA), established in 1945, follows a curriculum that emphasizes both practical and theoretical training. Training starts with a year of administrative training in ENA.31/ Recent reforms in ENA have widened the scope of field placements which now also include industry. Subjects of study include administration, budgeting and finance, international relations and law, and economics. Additional field attachments are sandwiched between these studies. Graduates are ranked according to their performance at ENA which in turn determines their first job assignment in government. Middle-level personnel in France are trained at the Regional Institute of Administration. The French approach thus has an exclusive focus on PET, and has significantly influenced the new training institutions of its former colonies.

In France as well as in other European countries, law in still the favored qualification for a public servant. Thus, French universities continue to engage in the teaching of administrative law to the neglect of public management. The Federal Republic of Germany and Italy provide IST for their public service through government-owned institutes of public administration. A survey shows that most of the training for the public service in Europe is organized by governments and not by universities.32/

An interesting model of training for the public service is found in Japan which until World War II had emphasized law as the preferred background for its bureaucratic elite. Since the 1950s, the Japanese training system has undergone major changes. Legislation has been enacted by the government specifying its training policy and the institutional arrangements for public service training.33/ While each ministry plans its own training, the National Personnel Authority (NPA) is the coordinating agency for all training in the public sector. In addition to on-the-job training, which has a long history in Japan, systematic training for all categories of public personnel is now organized through a vast network of institutions. Career development and training are closely linked through the NPA. PET and IST (which includes short-term training as well as studies abroad) are planned as part of the career development of personnel from the time they join the government. The government's own facilities, such as the National Institute of Public Administration, rather than universities play a major role in IST. The rapid expansion of IST in recent decades enables the Government to provide a training opportunity to one out of four public servants every year.34/ The focus of training in Japan is not merely on the acquisition of technocratic skills, but also on the creation of a strong sense of nationalism, cooperative work culture, and an empirical approach to administration.

The foregoing review reveals the diversity of approaches to PAMT among the more developed countries of the world. Despite their differences, the governments of all these countries, however, seem to play a growing and proactive role in the training of their personnel; the coverage is most extensive in the United States and in Japan. Governments' own training institutions are responsible for most of the IST in all countries.

Who Benefits from Training

Public sector employment has grown substantially in LDCs during the past three decades. Whether training has expanded to cope with the increasing needs of the public service is an important issue. A comparative analysis of experiences of some of the countries in Asia, Africa, and Latin America reveals the following:

1. Pre-entry training for the elite administrative cadres is the most systematically organized segment of PAMT.35/ In India, Malaysia, Pakistan and the Philippines, training programs extending from nine months to two years are offered by the major training institutions for all new entrants to the upperlevel administrative cadres. In countries that have public administration degree programs as part of the university system, in most cases the institutions concerned are chiefly engaged in pre-entry training for the higher-level services. Thus, the focus of training, by and large, has been the entry-level needs of the young administrators recruited to the central services.

2. For most officers even in the elite services, the initial pre-entry training is the only formal training they will ever receive in their career. Though there are institutions which offer in-service training - and all report expansion of their programs - the proportion of public servants who are able to take advantage of such training is small. For India, it is estimated that not more than 20% of the upper-level management group will be trained in service in their entire careers; the experience of Pakistan is similar. Even Malaysia and the Philippines, which have substantially expanded their training

activities in the 1970s, report that the coverage of IST leaves much to be desired. A committee report on Kenya's public service training has also highlighted the inadequacies in IST for different levels of personnel.36/ A World Bank survey of six countries in West Africa has shown that of the 35,000 senior- and middle-level managers in their public enterprises, no more than 11% have received any kind of management training. Weak linkages between career development and training and inadequacies in the training infrastructure are perhaps the most important reasons for the slow progress of IST.

3. Though lip service has been paid to the need for training public servants already in senior positions (as against young entrants who will eventually rise to senior positions), the record of actual training offered to this category of personnel is dismal indeed. With the exception of Malaysia, which has organized workshops and seminars for senior officials, the other three countries surveyed in the Asian study have not progressed much in this regard. In fact, a survey of Pakistan's experience shows that middle-level officials get sponsored to attend courses meant for their seniors as the latter do not as a rule respond to such programs. Surveying the African scene, one observer has recently noted:

> "CAFRAD experience in administrative training in Africa is that the very senior civil servants who need help most are the most reluctant to come forward for training. This is the commonest complaint our trainees make. What is the use of acquiring new knowledge, skills and attitudes if our bosses are not going to notice, let along appreciate, the changed performance behavior?"

The Kenyan report referred to earlier has stressed an urgent need to upgrade the management skills of the senior administrators in government. A UN report, making a similar observation, noted that if senior managers were exposed to and convinced of the utility of in-service training, it would have beneficial effects on the desire of lower-echelon staff to participate in in-service training programs.38/

There are, of course, exceptions to this pattern. The Government of Zimbabwe, soon after independence, initiated its very first series of training programs with a week-long workshop for all permanent secretaries with the Prime Minister being present in the first session. This workshop was followed by several two-week training programs for deputy secretaries and under secretaries. In a period of four months, practically all the senior officers of the new government (in all over 200 persons) participated in these programs. In view of the unique problems of transition in Zimbabwe and its mix of white and black officers, the political leadership considered it most important that the reorientation and training processes should start with the senior personnel in the government. An external evaluation of this series of training programs showed that the participants, many of whom had never attended such programs, were overwhelmingly positive about their training experience. Needless to say, this was an exceptional case of "top down training"!

Training tends to become even more haphazard and inadequate at lower levels in the public service. In most countries, such training is left to individual departments and agencies which may have no systematic training programs. As a result, the vast majority of public servants at lower levels in several countries do not receive any training at all. In Malaysia, it is reported that in 1978 only 4% of the total federal and state employees received any training whatsoever. Reports of ministries to the Civil Service Commission in the Philippines indicate that there are very few training programs for the clerical and craft levels of employees. In India, only 30% and 10% respectively of personnel in the lowest two categories are reported to have received any training at all in their entire careers.39/ The Kenyan report also points out that there is a major gap in the training of the lowest categories of personnel. In Latin American countries, lower-level training is stated to be the least organized.40/ A study of the training of local government officials in LDCs has shown that though they account for 20-30% of the total number of government employees, only 10-15% of the total government budget for training is allocated to them.

An important problem here is that very large numbers of people are employed in LDCs at the lower levels of the pyramid of public bureaucracies.41/ Increasing the coverage of training for the lower levels would involve not only a major reallocation of resources, but also considerably more complex, and decentralized organizational efforts for training. Though "training for all" has been declared a policy objective by several countries, evidence shows that very little progress has been made in meeting this goal.

Training for Public Enterprise Personnel

The rapid expansion of public enterprises, or parastatals as they are commonly referred to, in most LDCs, has been a phenomenon of the past decade or two. In planning the new training institutions in the 1950s, neither donors nor LDC governments seem to have anticipated the special needs of these organizations. International concern about the training needs of public enterprises (PEs) began to be voiced widely only in the 1970s.42/ Unlike in public service training, there is no single central agency in most LDCs whose primary task is to look after the training of PE personnel, as evidence is hard to gather.

Most developing countries, it appears, draw on the resources of business schools, private management consulting firms, and to some extent, institutes of public administration for upgrading the managerial skills of their public enterprise personnel. In some countries, large public enterprises have set up their own management training centers. For the training of some of their senior personnel, they utilize civil service training centers and staff colleges. Very few LDC governments have set up separate institutions to train managers of public enterprises. Egypt's National Institute of Management Development is one such example and India's Institute for Public Enterprises is another. In Sri Lanka, the National Institute of Management was established originally to serve the needs of public enterprises. Most other management institutes or schools tend to cater to both private and public enterprise needs, though once again data are hard to come by on the coverage of training for different levels of PE personnel. Our discussions on the training needs of public enterprises and institutional arrangements to meet them are continuing and a number of experiments in training are under way in different national and regional centers.43/

III. TRAINING POLICIES

One of the preconditions for effective training mentioned in Chapter I is the existence of a national training policy for the public service. When training activities are performed in an ad hoc manner without the guidance of a policy framework, inefficient use of scarce resources and duplication of efforts are bound to occur. The training needs of different categories of personnel and different agencies of government are numerous and varied. It is imperative, therefore, that the objectives of training and guidelines for planning, directing and monitoring this activity be laid down by government as part of an integrated policy.

Ingredients of a Training Policy

Ideally, a training policy for the public service should state the objectives and scope of all training activities, approaches to training needs assessment, the priorities and financing arrangements, the roles and functions of different categories of training institutions and mechanisms for coordinating their work, linkages of training to career planning and development, and guidelines for the monitoring and evaluation of training. Training policies must be based on a careful assessment of future national tasks and manpower requirements. Publicly declared training policies help employees understand the development opportunities available to them. For those who manage training in government, policies provide a framework within which to plan their programs, seek resources, and guide and evaluate performance. On the other hand, policy guidelines should not be so rigid and detailed that adaptation to changing circumstances becomes difficult. The key ingredients of a good training policy are enunciated here and LDC experiences examined against this framework.

1. Objectives and Scope of Training. One of the responsibilities of a government is to publicly declare the objectives and scope of public service training and the importance it attaches to this function so that government's expectations are clear to both the employees to be trained as well as those who perform training tasks. It is for the government to relate its objectives for training to the national goals and environment of the country. Though specific

objectives of the training might vary, most governments expect training to lead to improved and more efficient public service through the development of appropriate skills, knowledge, and abilities in their personnel. The boundaries of training may also be drawn through a policy directive. For example, a government may assign considerable importance to in-service training and much less to pre-entry training. It may support in-service training through its own institutions and assign only a limited role to self-development of personnel through non-governmental institutions.

2. Assessment of Training Needs. An important function of policy is to offer guidelines on the systematic assessment of training needs and assignment of responsibility for this task among relevant agencies so that orderly planning of training activities is facilitated. Identification of training needs is essential at three levels: (a) national, (b) institutional, and (c) individual training program. A broad assessment of training needs from a national perspective must be undertaken periodically so that training institutions can be assigned appropriate training tasks and made to adapt to the changing requirements of the nation. A national assessment must take into account both the maintenance and development needs of the government. The strategies and priorities of development programs, training needs perceived by the different government agencies, and diagnosis of prevailing administrative inadequacies are among the sources of inputs for such a national exercise. Given the nature of this assessment, the central agency concerned with training, or another appropriate national body, should be assigned the responsibility for this task.

Assessment of training needs at the institutional program level must be undertaken within the framework of priorities generated by the national exercise. Once each training institution is assigned an area of training responsibility, a more detailed exercise in identifying the needs must be undertaken by its professional staff. A variety of methodologies and techniques of analysis of needs are available from which institutions must choose an appropriate mix. Among these methods are contextual analysis which relates needs to the gaps in specific administrative deficiencies, consultation with client organizations, feedback from former trainees, systematic field surveys of training needs, experimental program as a learning device, and the critical incident technique. The choice of methods clearly cannot be done through a policy directive. Policy, however, must identify the key agencies or institutions most appropriate to perform this important function and assign specific roles and responsibilities so that an integrated view of training needs emerges.

3. Training Plans, Strategies, and Priorities. In light of the results of the exercise on assessing needs, a policy decision must be taken on the overall training plan for the government, its underlying strategy, and priorities in terms of the tasks to be accomplished. Training needs generally exceed the resources available so that it becomes imperative to decide what will and will not go into a plan. This decision implies the choice of a mix of training programs that best meets the national needs. This is a strategic decision which must be influenced by what resources - human, financial, and organizational - are available in the short run and the long run. Policy guidelines indicating government's priorities and resources are essential to assist institutions in making their choices. Policy decisions on annual-term and long-term training plans must be based on an iterative process of interaction among individual institutions, and the central policy and coordinating agencies. Here again, while no policy can lay down the content of a training plan, the roles and responsibilities of different agencies in this task and the criteria and processes they must adopt are matters for policy decision. Policy guidelines for financing different types of training, for example, will indicate to both training agencies and public servants the degree of financial support they can expect for training.

4. Monitoring and Evaluation of Training. In most LDCs, training institutions are established and training activities are initiated, but governments do not perform their rightful role in monitoring and evaluating training. Trainers are so involved in the design of curricula and the mechanics of training that institutionalization of evaluation remains a weak area. There are both quantitative and qualitative dimensions to evaluation. First of all, when resources are allocated to approved training programs, mechanisms must be established for the periodic monitoring of the inputs and outputs (however imperfect) of these activities. They need to be aggregated at the national level and their trends and performance evaluated. Second, qualitative

evaluation of individual training programs and institutions must be encouraged. This is a more complex task and requires the creation of institutional review mechanisms the working of which are monitored by a central agency. There are several methods of evaluation and different levels at which evaluation must be done. From a national point of view, the most important concern is the impact of training on organizational performance. Policy guidelines must specify (a) the criteria and periodicity of monitoring and evaluation, and (b) the roles and responsibilities of different agencies and institutions in this task. Policy reviews of a continuous nature can be attempted only when the monitoring function is strong.

5. Career Development Linkages to Training. An important reason for the neglect of the evaluative function in training is the absence of suitable linkages between the broader personnel policies of government and training. The remedy lies in integrating training policy with the relevant aspects of the personnel policies of the government. The key areas for this purpose are career development planning and promotion. As pointed out in Chapter I, training effectiveness is significantly influenced by whether the career development and promotion prospects of public servants are affected by training. If training contributes to their career progress and their training performance is a formal input to their evaluation, their motivation to use training will be strengthened. Policy guidelines specifying the links between these elements are the most effective means to inform public servants on how their career progress will be influenced by training. Relating training to different stages in a person's career, feeding inputs from training into his performance evaluation, and taking training into account in promotion decisions are aspects on which guidelines must be established. The administrative mechanisms for coordinating the implementation of these guidelines must also be stated in the policy.

A comprehensive training policy will contain suitable guidelines on the different dimensions relevant to training discussed above. Operational decisions on training must be taken within the framework of these guidelines. However, since a country's development needs and tasks change over time, there should also be a provision in the policy for its periodic review and redesign whenever it becomes necessary. A good training policy is dynamic in nature and will, therefore, specify the mechanisms for the review process.

Progress towards Training Policies in LDCs

A quick survey of the available literature shows that only a small number of LDCs have formally adopted training policies by law or by executive order. In Latin Americ some countries have passed civil service laws which make references to training, but most do not have any declared training policy.45/ In Africa, the United Nations Economic Commission for Africa has mounted a major effort to have governments adopt formal manpower and training policies. No country in the region has, however, passed any legislation or executive orders on its public service training policy in a comprehensive manner. At a recent meeting of the ministers concerned with human resource planning in 23 African countries, a strong consensus emerged on the need to formulate national training policies.44/

> "Governments should demonstrate their commitment to the importance of training by installing definitive training policies which would facilitate a more planned and integrated approach to human resources planning, development and utilization...Given the urgency and importance of human resources development, governments were urged to enforce political commitment by installing training policies and backing them with legislative enactments. Governments should establish some system for coordinating, directing, monitoring and evaluating the national effort in accordance with national policy, plans, and programs.45/

One African country which has recently attempted a formal exercise to formulate a training policy for the public service is Zimbabwe. The large-scale influx of new recruits into the public service after independence, the need to augment the supply of trained manpower to assist in the reconstruction and development of a war-torn economy, and constraints on resources were the major factors which convinced the political leadership to give priority to the formulation of an integrated training policy for the public service. Though the

Government of Zimbabwe has gone ahead with the expansion of training facilities in pursuance of some of its policy decisions, the pace of progress has been slow due to manpower limitations. Other countries, such as Kenya and Nigeria, have had Committees of Inquiry whose reports have led to policy decisions on some aspects of training. These decisions, however, do not constitute a comprehensive statement of training policy. In Asia, a recent survey has highlighted only three countries (Pakistan, Malaysia, and Philippines) as having publicly declared training policies.46/ The Administrative Reforms Commission of India had made comprehensive recommendations of training in 1969, but only a partial adoption of the proposed training policy followed.47/ In the vast majority of LDCs, formal statements of training policy probably do not exist. Guidelines on training, generally seems to have evolved over time, and policy decisions, if any, have been taken only on some aspects of policy. One likely consequence of this approach is that ad hoc decisions tend to prevail and long-term planning that is essential in human resources development gets low priority.

The adoption of policies does not necessarily lead to their implementation. In Nigeria, a training policy was declared by the Government in 1969, but no action was taken on it for two years.48/ In spite of a policy statement, implementation was reported to be weak in Pakistan; in Malaysia, on the other hand, the training policy is reported to have been more effectively implemented. In training as in other areas of policy, successful implementation requires strong and continued political and bureaucratic support. In Malaysia, there was a high degree of commitment and support to the proposals of the new training policy at the levels of both political and bureaucratic leadership. In contrast, in Pakistan, the degree of support was not strong and stable. According to a review of the Pakistan experience:

> "The network of training institutions proposed in the training policy were duly established, but they were not provided with financial and personnel support for effective functioning. The stipulation linking training with promotion remained only a pious hope."49/

In Pakistan, the frequent changes in the political leadership of the country and the demoralization suffered by the bureaucracy during this period are reported to be among the reasons why the implementation of training policy did not lead to the desired results.

A close integration of public service training with broader personnel policies such as on promotion, for example, does not exist in many countries. The survey of the four Asian countries referred to earlier shows that only Malaysia has been able to report some progress in this respect. In some categories and levels, training is a precondition for crossing the efficiency bar which in turn is a condition for eligibility for further promotion.50/ The Malaysian policy has also encouraged mid-level post-graduate training of officers towards specialization in the service by providing funds for this scheme and support to proper job assignment upon completion of training. Similar developments have been reported in this area in Guyana and Jamaica.51/

A recent Commonwealth Secretariat conference of representatives of eight LDCs unanimously agreed that the absence of policies linking training to career development is a major barrier to the effectiveness of public enterprise training in their countries.52/ Clearly, the integration of training with personnel policies is the hardest to achieve; this alone could reinforce and fully utilize the potential of training in improving the quality and performance of public servants. In this regard, the gap between the military and civilian public service experience in LDCs continues to be substantially wide.

Even governments which have adopted formal training policies have reported the assessment of training needs and evaluation of training as weak areas. A review of the Philippine experience shows that training needs are determined by institutions on an impressionistic basis.53/ Operating managers generally leave this task to the training staff who tend to focus on what training courses could be offered rather than what the employees need. Experience in India also confirms this tendency on the part of training institutions.54/ Quite often, those responsible for training fail to undertake systematic surveys of needs over reasonable periods of time with the result the training curricula become obsolete or irrelevant to the changing needs of the clientele. The lack of involvement of ministries and other line agencies in this exercise makes it even more difficult to get a realistic assessment of training needs.

When a systematic assessment of needs is attempted, it does contribute significantly to the improvement of training programs. In India, an analysis of the development plan needs initiated by the Planning Commission in consultation with the Training Division of the Department of Personnel led to the identification of a set of new training needs in project appraisal, implementation, and monitoring. New training programs were designed to meet these needs and separate funds were provided under the development plan to organize new training programs by involving a wider network of institutions.55/ In Malaysia, the system of requiring departments to submit annual training bids to the central Training and Career Development Division has been found to be a good way of ascertaining departmental training needs.56/

In some cases, it is not the lack of interest on the failure to assign the responsibility for assessment properly, but the use of inappropriate methods which leads to a wrong assessment of training needs. In 1974, CAFRAD, the African Regional Center in Morocco, had developed a model curriculum for rural development training on the assumption that a standard training design would meet the needs of all countries in the region.57/ CAFRAD decided to test this design in two member countries, Ghana and Zambia. In Zambia, advantage was taken of a meeting of 25 rural project managers to explore their training needs based on the current problems faced by them. The "critical incident" technique, which was used in this survey, elicited information from the respondents on the incidents in their experience that were "critical" in rendering their performance effective or ineffective.58/

No training policy can possibly offer guidelines on the methodologies to be used in assessing training needs under diverse conditions. Nevertheless, the initiation of such a policy would strengthen the capacity of training institutions to perform this task adequately. In most LDCs, this capacity is weak and policies have not been designed or used to remedy this lacuna.

Similarly, there is no evidence that countries that have declared training policies have necessarily been able to evaluate the impact of their training activities more systematically than others. The study of the four Asian countries, referred to earlier, confirms that evaluation seldom goes beyond a questionnaire survey of trainees at the conclusion of their training.59/ Follow-up of the trainees to assess the impact of training they underwent on their job performance and the broader evaluation of the impact of a set of training activities on the performance of the participant organizations have indeed been rare. The ECA report on Africa referred to above also has highlighted the lack of systematic evaluation as a major gap.60/ Apart from methodological problems in evaluation and the limits on policy capabilities for evaluation in LDCs due to manpower and financial constraints, a basic problem lies in the fact that the performance evaluation process within governments does not typically seek inputs on training. A major incentive for the systematic evaluation of training and its impact is thus absent in the larger governmental system.

Broad-based administrative reform measures preceded the strong interest in training policy found in the four Asian countries discussed (India, Malaysia, Pakistan and the Philippines). The same has been the experience in other countries such as Brazil, Iran, Lebanon, Nigeria, Senegal and Zimbabwe.61/ Another recent trend has been to relate training directly to ongoing improvement measures accomplished in the context of broader organization and management studies. Guyana, Jamaica and Kenya are examples of countries following such an approach.62/ In general, a good strategy seems to be to integrate training policy into a broader set of reforms so that it gets reinforced by supportive changes from other parts of the larger system.

Training Policies for Public Enterprises

The literature on training policy related to public enterprises (PEs) is even more limited than that on LDC governments; this is partly due to the fact that among many LDCs, public enterprises are a recent phenomenon, the problems of which are only just beginning to attract public attention. A comparison of public enterprises by the Commonwealth Secretariat and the Asian and Pacific Development Administration Centre (APDAC) highlighted problems that surprisingly were similar to our earlier account of the training policy problems of LDC governments in general. The survey by the Commonwealth Secretariat covered Bangladesh, India, Jamaica, Malaysia, Mauritius, Nigeria, Sri Lanka and Tanzania whereas the APDAC study covered India, Indonesia, Malaysia, Pakistan, the Philippines and Thailand.63,64/ The major weaknesses in training policy identified by both surveys were:

1. Lack of proper identification of training needs and a strong tendency to follow the traditional civil service type syllabi and methods.

2. Absence of a strong and coordinated training policy for public enterprises and laxity in integrating training programs of different types leading to the inefficient use of resources.

3. Weak personnel policy and failure to link training to the career development of individual managers.

4. General inadequacy of training programs to meet expanding needs, inappropriate content and teaching materials.

5. Failure to treat investment in training as a long-term goal and reluctance of government or top management of enterprises to allocate adequate funds for training.

6. Lack of, or ad hoc, evaluation measures to assess the impact and relevance of training both at the enterprise and training institutional levels.

The recommendations of the survey by the Commonwealth Secretariat, however, did not deal with all the policy problems mentioned above. They focussed on (a) the selection of the target groups which should receive training and the broad strategies to be adopted in planning appropriate programs; (b) identification of the major subject areas relevant to public enterprise management; (c) specification of the design of training activities in the identified areas (in-house versus external training, duration of training, and so forth); and (d) financial support and commitment to training at the policy-making level.65/

There are three areas of public-enterprise training policy which need special attention. First, at the policymaking level, a distinction should be made between the commonalities shared by all public enterprises in a country and the special needs of individual enterprises in training. Different strategies need to be evolved to deal with the training requirements arising from this differentiation. Second, even though the distinction outlined in the preceding sentence is valid, there is a case for a central initiative in assessing the total training needs of all public enterprises in a country. Because public enterprises tend to get attached to different ministries, their training needs are seldom viewed and assessed from the standpoint of economizing on the use of resources (such as jointly organizing training). Third, in view of the large number of public enterprises as well as their autonomy, it is important to establish a policy for the monitoring and evaluation of training activities. Policy guidelines in this area should assist governments to oversee their performance in human resource development.

IV. TRAINING INSTITUTIONS: THEIR STRUCTURE AND PROGRAMS

The network of public administration and management training (PAMT) institutions from 91 developing countries listed in the ILO Directory can be divided into four main categories: (1) Government-owned and government-managed institutions primarily engaged in non-degree training programs; (2) autonomous institutions engaged in PAMT; (3) university related institutions offering educational and training (leading to a degree or equivalent) programs; and (4) management institutes or schools set up to provide training in enterprise management, but which have diversified into PAMT.66/ Although the distinction among these categories is useful, it tends to get blurred in some cases as institutions operate in several areas simultaneously. Thus, in recent years, the public administration institutes in Indonesia, Malaysia, and Thailand have diversified to become national institutes for both public administration and management. Nevertheless, it is useful to divide the institutions into four categories and by geographical region in order to understand the structure of the network. Table 4.1 presents the results of this analysis for 236 institutions in 91 developing countries.

+50

Table 4.1
Institutions by Category and Region

	Asia	Africa	Latin America	Total
University departments or schools of administration	27	20	38	85 (35.5)
Autonomous institutes of administration	11	12	13	36 (15.0)
Government institutions of training	39	44	22	105 (45.0)
Management institutes	5	2	3	10 (45.0)
Total	82	78	76	236 (100.0)

Note: The figures in parentheses denote percentages.

The numerical distribution of institutions does not, of course, truly reflect the magnitude or impact of their operations. University departments of administration are geneally small in most LDCs and are engaged in undergraduate and graduate teaching for the most part. Their annual output of graduates, therefore, tends to be small compared to the throughput of government training centers that offer several short-term progams. A university department or school of public administration typically has an annual intake of 50 students. A civil service academy, on the other hand, may admit a much larger number for training each year. For example, the Indian National Academy of Administration annually trains 275 probationers in its year-long professional course. If the trainees in its short-term programs are added, the total number trained at this Academy will exceed 1300.67/

An analysis of Table 4.1 shows that PAMT institutions are about evenly distributed in numbers among the three developing regions of the world. But the number is certainly fewer per country in Africa than in Asia and Latin America. This is not surprising given that independence was won by most African countries in more recent years and that their size and population are generally smaller than those of some countries in other regions. The table also shows the overall dominance of government-owned institutions (45%) followed by university-related institutions (35.5%). In fact, in Latin America, university-related institutions form the single largest group. Autonomous institutes have the third place (15%) in all regions and management institutes constitute the smallest category (4.5%).

Private consulting firms also play a growing role in the network of PAMT institutions. Agencies such as the World Bank and USAID have provided training assistance to a wide variety of projects in LDCs through foreign consultants. The project-related training (PRT) component in the World Bank's project and program loans has been an important instrument in this process. However, the practice of using short-term consultants does not necessarily lead to the institutionalization of the training activity within the country. But if local PAMT institutions and experts are involved, there is a greater probability that indigenous training capacity will be strengthened over time.

Table 4.2

A Typology of Public Administration and Management Training Institutions

Category	Types of Training	Target Groups	Duration of Training	Types of Professional Staff
Civil Service Training Academy (Government owned and managed).	Pre-entry training(PET) In-service training(IST) nondegree classroom work and field attachments.	New recruits to public service - middle and senior level personnel of ministries/departments.	PET - 3-24 months IST - 1-12 weeks Short seminars/ workshops.	Experienced civil servants on secondment and academic trainers.
Ecole Nationale D'Administration (Francophone)	PET (prior to recruitment) classroom work and field attachments.	Pre-entry candidates mostly for the public service.	1-3 years	Experienced civil servants and academic specialists.
University School Department of Public Administration	Mostly PET (degree/ diploma programs) Part-time IST	Students - middle level administrators.	1-2 years	Permanent academic faculty and parttime visiting faculty from public service.
Autonomous Institutions of Public Administration	Mostly IST, some PET classrooms work and some field projects (sometimes leading to degree).	Middle level personnel in government - public enterprise managers.	1-9 months Short programs/ seminars	Permanent academic faculty and visiting practitioners.
Administrative Staff College	IST, classroom work	Senior and middle level personnel in government public and private enterprise managers.	1-12 weeks short seminars for top levels.	Permanent faculty with academic and practical experience and some visiting faculty.
Management Training Institute	PET, IST, project related training - Classroom work and field projects/ attachments (leading to degree/diploma in PET).	Young people interested in private and public enterprises - middle and senior level personnel from government and industry program/project personnel.	1-2 years for PET; 1-12 weeks for IST; short seminars for top level.	Permanent faculty with academic and practical experience and visiting faculty.
Sectoral Training Institute/Center	IST, PRT (PET rarely) Classroom work and field projects.	Middle level and technical personnel program/project personnel.	1-9 months 1-2 years (occasionally)	Academic specialists and practising sectoral administrators.

Institutional Categories: Distinctive Features

The four PAMT segments listed in Table 4.1 may be further subdivided into smaller groups with distinctive features of their own. For example, government-owned training institutions in most LDCs influenced by British or U.S. training models have civil service training academies or institutes whereas in Francophone Africa, the Ecole National d'Administration (ENA) is the dominant training institution. Autonomous institutions include Institutes of Public Administration as well as Administrative Staff Colleges. Along with full fledged management institutes, the new sectoral management institutes and centers must also be considered. In all, seven categories of PAMT institutions have thus been identified even though their numerical distribution is not fully known. Table 4.2 summarizes the types of training, target groups, duration of training, and the types of professional staff characteristic of these categories. Their main features are discussed further in the remainder of this section.

1. Civil Service Academy (CSA)

This type of institution is heavily engaged in induction training, long-term pre-entry training for new recruits into the major administrative cadres of government, and in-serving training for mostly middle-level personnel.68/ Its programs cover general and functional administration. The foundation course for new recruits will have a strong general orientation (study of the national environment, economics, law, planning, etc.) whereas functional courses in financial management or project management for middle-level personnel will have a more specialist focus. If the institute is meant for a single ministry, the technical or specialist orientation in training will be even stronger.

2. Ecole Nationale d'Administration (ENA)

The typical ENA program is of the long-term pre-entry training type.69/ Its training has a generalist orientation with emphasis on several subjects such as administrative theories, politics and economics, personnel management, development planning, financial management and international relations. The ENA of Ivory Coast follows this approach though its orientation is regarded as somewhat more theoretical and divorced from the realities of the local environment. ENA is supervised by the Civil Service Ministry and in some cases offers also short-term training programs of a specialized type. ENAs in the Gabon and Niger offer short-term programs.

3. University Departments of Administration (UDA)

The primary task of UDA is preparing young graduates for careers in government through pre-entry training. A degree on diploma is awarded to successful graduates. Courses cover both general and functional administration areas. The curricula of most UDAs have been heavily influenced by the U.S. public administration curricula which were exported to LDCs in the 1950s and 1960s. Some UDAs are also active in in-service training, especially by offering part-time courses for administrators. The Philippine College of Public Administration, for example, is engaged in both pre-entry and in-service training. Where governments encourage self-development as part of the training policy, UDAs may offer specialized courses (accounting, personnel management, and so forth) for practicing administrators and public enterprise personnel on a part-time basis.

4. Autonomous Institutes of Public Administration (AIPA)

Generally, an AIPA will be larger than a university department of administration, but smaller in size than most civil service academies. In-service training is the primary task of an AIPA, though some do offer pre-entry training of a degree or diploma type. For example, the Indian Institute of Public Administration is engaged only in in-service training whereas the Saudi Arabian Institute of Public Administration and the Brazilian Institute of Public Administration offer pre-entry training as well.70/ Their curricula are very similar to those of UDAs, except that in in-service training, AIPAs have moved into more specialized areas (such as project planning, apraisal and management, and performance budgeting) and adapted new curricula to suit their needs. To the extent AIPAs are engaged in the training of public enterprise personnel, their curricula have been influenced by enterprise management concepts and tools and frameworks of analysis.

5. Administrative Staff College (ASC)

The ASC is designed as a hybrid institution in most LDCs, patterned along the lines of the one in Henley in the U.K. It is exclusively engaged in training senior managers in the service of both public and private sectors. The

ASC of India, the East African Staff College (now ESAMI) and the Philippine Executive Academy have followed this model. The Administrative Staff College in Nigeria which has been funded fully by the Government is engaged chiefly in the training of public sector personnel. The curricula of ASCs draw upon both public administration and management and they are known for their extensive use of the "syndicate method" of teaching. Joint programs on management and policy problems for both public and private sector senior managers are seen as a useful forum for mutual interaction and learning, apart from the substantive acquisition of knowledge and skills.

6. Management Training Institute (MTI)

MTIs have in recent years engaged in training for both public and private enterprises through pre-entry and in-service training. Courses on the contextual problems of public enterprises have been added to their curricula to make training more relevant to these enterprises. Recruitment of graduates of MTIs by public undertakings is now common in many LDCs. A more recent development is the engagement of some MTIs in in-service training work for the public service: the Indian Institute of Management in Ahmedabad and the Central American Institute of Business Administration in Nicaragua both have offered this form of training to middle- and senior-level personnel in government. The Indian institute's in-service training covers both general administration and management topics based on field research and consultancy experience. MTIs have also participated in project-related training at the invitation of donor agencies and national governments; this follows frequently from their research and consulting work.71/

7. Sector Training Institute (STI)

In recent years a number of sectoral training institutions have been established in LDCs for such sectors as agriculture, rural development and health. There are no reliable estimates of such institutes even though they are relevant because in their technology-oriented training programs for middle and senior level personnel, PAMT is an important component. Thus, the National Institute of Rural Development and the new Institute of Rural Management in India, the Nigerian Institute of Agricultural and Rural Management Training, the Managua Agricultural Management Centre in Swaziland, and the Agricultural Management Training Institute in Bangladesh are engaged in PAMT specifically for the agricultural and rural sector. Their main engagement is in in-service training; their courses emphasize agricultural project management and operations management. Some of their work arises from project-related training supported by donors.

Some of the existing general management institutes also cater to the training needs of the agricultural sector. For example, there is a Centre for Management in Agriculture at the Indian Institute of Management in Ahmedabad. A Rural Development Group at the Asian Institute of Management in Manila offers training and consultancy service in agricultural management. Such new development in PAMT deserves to be noted, though it is not possible to offer a break-up of the new institutions by regions.

There are alao regional and inter-governmental institutions of which three have been established under UN auspices. These are the Asian and Pacific Development Administration Centre (APDAC) in Kuala Lumpur, the African Training and Research Centre in Administration for Development (CAFRAD) in Tangiers, and the Latin American Centre for Development Administration (CLAD) in Caracas.72/ At the regional and subregional level, there are a number of other training-cum-research centers which have been established as inter-governmental institutions with or without external assistance. Thus, the East and Southern African Management Institute (ESAMI) in Tanzania, the Pan-African Institute for Development (PAID) with four centers in different parts of Africa, the Central American Institute for Public Administration (ICAP) in Costa Rica, and the Carribean Centre for Development Administration (CARICAD) in Barbados, are examples of the latter type. Both types are engaged in PAMT activities, though the latter perhaps play a more active role in training the personnel of the participating governments. In addition to training of public servants, they organize training programs for trainers, seminars and workshops on training-related issues, and disseminate reports and other publications on training. The Economic Development Institute of the World Bank, through its training programs at the regional level, is also collaborating and strengthening national and regional PAMT institutions. In the segment of institutions discussed above, these institutions are not included since the nature and scope of their activities are different from those of the seven categories presented in Table 4.2.

Curricula and Methodologies

In the preceding section, we merely referred to the types and scope of training in different categories of PAMT institutions; this section will illustrate their curricula and methodologies. The examples are drawn from an in-service training program for middle-level administrators, a pre-entry program for sectoral training, and a proposed program for public enterprise managers. These are by no means representative of all training programs, but are suggestive of the range of curricula and methods in vogue.

1. JET-STREAM

The Junior Executive Training-Supervisory Training for Effective Administrative Management (JET-STREAM) was started in 1972 by the Government of the Philippines to enhance the effectiveness of middle managers in their thirties who are in important positions in the bureaucracy by instilling in them a sense of professionalism, discipline and commitment to development tasks.73/ It was conducted in two stages, a conceptual part called JET, and a practical workshop after the JET graduates were back on the job for six months. JET was conducted Saturday afternoons (25 half days). In 1977, after nearly 20,000 persons were trained, this program was converted into a single three-week live-in program. It makes extensive use of experiential methods of teaching by making classroom learning applicable to work situations.

The curriculum of the program aims to provide participants a working knowledge of effective management, supervision, and administration within the Philippine environment. The first component of the curriculum provides a perspective on the issues and problems of national development, the Philippine cultural heritage and values, rural-urban dynamics, and the nation's role in international affairs. The second component is designed to teach supervisory role and functions, managerial functions of planning, programming and organizing work, and team management. Managerial tools for planning and control, information systems, budgetary processes and decision-making in all aspects are covered in this segment. The third module focuses on human behavior in organization. Personnel policies, evaluation, incentives and motivation, grievances and sanctions are among the subjects covered in this part.

The resource persons for this program are drawn from the government, academia, and business. It makes extensive use of cases, role playing, exercises and films. It entails field visits and weekly examinations. High performers are considered for entry into the higher career executive service. The program is organized by the Civil Service Academy.

2. A Program for Rural Development Managers

The Institute of Rural Management at Anand (IRMA) in India started a new two-year management program in 1979 for young graduates in their early twenties.74/ Since IRMA was sponsored by the National Dairy Development Board of India, this activity was envisaged as a pre-entry training program to meet the needs of the cooperative segment of the dairy and agriculture sector of the economy. The program is unique in that 40% of the 80 weeks of study is devoted to field work by students in villages as well as producers' cooperative societies in different parts of the country.

The program curriculum consists of three parts: (1) a class study segment with four ten-week terms of intensive, case based training in managerial decision making in the context of different functional areas such as production, marketing, finance and personnel; (2) a field study segment to sensitize students to rural realities with two spells of five weeks each during which students stay in groups of 4-6, and study the village structure and possible approaches to social change; and (3) a management traineeship segment with two spells of 10-12 weeks each during which students study under managers of producer cooperatives in functional areas of their choice. Faculty members work together with students in all three components, and also teach additional courses on the rural environment and problems in managing farmers' organizations.

The first batch of 47 graduates received their diplomas and left IRMA in 1980 and are working in 10 different farmer's organizations or cooperatives. Early reports indicate that their acceptability in the rural organizations where where they have been placed is quite positive. IRMA is probably the first among sectoral institutions in agriculture to launch a PET program successfully.

3. A Curriculum for Public Enterprise General Management (PEGM)

At the initiative of the Commonwealth Secretariat, a working group, which included six experts from Asian and African countries, met in Mauritius to recommend suitable curricula for training in public enterprises.75/ The group identified eleven areas for the development of curricula; these included:

- Macro perspectives of public enterprises
- Public enterprise system
- Organizational structures, institutional patterns and management processes
- Corporate planning
- Personnel management
- Management information and control systems
- Financing and financial management
- Performance evaluation
- Marketing
- Technological choice
- Materials management

Each of these areas was further spelled out in detail by the group. It was pointed out that the depth of treatment of these subjects will vary depending upon the target group and its background. The group also recognized that the curriculum will need to be adapted to the specific conditions obtaining in the country. However, no recommendations were offered on the teaching methods, sequencing of subjects and their integration. As may be seen from the topics listed above, except for the first two, all others related to the functions which normally form part of any standard management training curriculum. The real question is how to tailor them to the needs of public enterprises and what conceptual knowledge, tools and practical applications and experience are available to make a new curriculum that is both challenging and relevant.

Training Methodologies

The role of training in the mix of activities of the different categories of institutions reviewed in this chapter has varied widely. Government institutions are almost exclusively engaged in training; this does not mean that classroom teaching is their sole activity. In many LDCs, pre-entry training has a field work component. But, by and large, the focus is on training individuals in classrooms, and not on research, consultancy, and related tasks except in Francophone Africa, where a strong tradition of combining classroom learning with practical experience at work exists.

The autonomous and university-related institutes and departments of administration also devote most of their time and resources to training and education programs. Their charter in most cases requires them to engage in research and consultancy. In practice, however, since most of their resources are devoted to classroom teaching, neither research nor consultancy gets much attention. Most of the training materials and textbooks used by these two categories of institutions come from foreign sources and lecture is their popular method of teaching.76/ An analysis of the public administration institutes in Saudi Arabia and Jordan showed that lectures were the most popular method and that case study and role playing were the least used.77/

The newer types of management training institutes in LDCs have departed from the classroom-teaching approach to training. While they do engage in classroom training, increasing attention is devoted to research and consultancy which feed back into training. The development of indigenous training materials through field research is emphasized by most of these newer institutions and an attempt is made to bring into the classroom consultancy insights and findings from the field. It is not that none among the other categories of institutions follows this approach, but that it has not been their dominant tradition. Among the management institutes, sectoral institutions and consultants involved in project-related training on behalf of donor agencies, the tendency to be experiential is more pronounced as they have a stronger tradition of combining training with field research and consultancy activites. Their training methodologies, therefore, tend to use cases, group discussion, action learning, and other participative methods more often than lectures. A shift towards a similar diversification of training methodologies in the first two categories of institutions in some LDCs is reported to have occurred in recent years, according to a sample survey undertaken by the Commonwealth Secretariat.

V. EVALUATION OF TRAINING

Evaluation is a subject on which a great deal has been written in the literature on training.78/ The million-dollar question that donors and LDC governments frequently ask is whether there are practical ways to measure the impact of training on the performance of the economy. In the case of worker training, it is not difficult to evaluate the impact of training as there are measurable outputs that can be identified and compared with those of employees that have received no training. In the case of PAMT, it is more difficult to identify the relevant outputs and effects of training since control conditions are not as easy to create as in a factory setting. In the private sector, the response of training to institutional programs offers a good market test of its effectiveness. If some types of training programs do not attract an adequate clientele, the underlying message is loud and clear. In the government sector, however, most training is internally organized, so impact cannot be judged through the market test. Similarly, the application of economic cost-benefit techniques to public training activities is rather difficult as earning differentials of the private market variety have no counterpart in the public sector context.

Nevertheless, PAMT institutions seek to influence the behavior of their public sector clientele with a view to improving the performance of the administrative systems of government. In evaluating their performance and impact, institutions must ascertain the degree to which expected behavioral changes have, in fact, occurred and its influence on the administrative systems's level of performance. This is a difficult exercise for three reasons. First, behavioral changes and skill development of the clientele may be a small part of the complex of factors which determine the performance of the administrative system. Second, the behavioral changes and skills of the clientele could be rendered less effective by hostile organizational climate in the larger administrative system. Third, the necessary knowledge and techniques for evaluation may not exist or be available. A mix of these factors in varying degrees of intensity prevails in all LDCs. Definitive impact studies of PAMT are, however, difficult to find, and most studies reported in the literature are of a qualitative nature.

Focus of Evaluation

In view of these difficulties, rigorous studies of the impact of training on public sector performance have seldom been attempted by donors or LDC governments. The kinds of evaluation studies typically undertaken by those engaged in training focus on: (1) individual training programs (2) training institutions and (3) training assistance projects financed by donors. The objectives of such studies usually determine whether their results are disseminated to the public. Thus, training programs are internally evaluated by institutions in order to feedback results to the faculty as part of a process of improving future programs. This explains why evaluation results of individual training programs are seldom made public. On the other hand, the evaluation of institutions and groups of projects is commonly undertaken by governments or donors. This type of evaluation is in the nature of a post-mortem, the findings of which are sometimes available in the public domain.79/ Unfortunately, unless impact studies of the entire set of training institutions in a country are available, it is difficult to draw any worthwhile conclusions on the effectiveness of training for the country as a whole. The focus of international donors, on the other hand, is on the set of projects with which they are associated. Since these are likely to be distributed among several countries, it is not easy to generate measures of effectiveness for each country out of these studies.

Nevertheless, different types of evaluation evidence are reviewed in the following pages. The data and findings have been gathered from three sources. (1) Donor agencies which have financed different forms of training assistance and institution building in many LDCs; (2) Western observers and scholars who have attempted an evaluation of PAMT in LDCs; and (3) LDC governments or their spokesmen who have attempted an overview of their training performance and problems. Even though the methodologies adopted by these diverse evaluators are not fully known, a synthesis of their findings has been attempted to find some interpretation of the lessons to be learnt.

Donors' View of Effectiveness

The Ford Foundation, USAID, the UN, OECD, and the World Bank, have in recent years documented their assessment of the impact of their training assistance to LDCs. Both USAID and the Ford Foundation were heavily involved in technical assistance for public administration since the 1950s. Their major conclusions on the impact of their assistance and the effectiveness of the institutions they financed may be summarized as follows:80/

(1) Assistance for public administration did not produce the impact that was expected. The new institutions were able to cover only a small proportion of the administrative cadres in LDCs. Their contribution to the improvement of government's administrative capacity fell far below expectations.

(2) The new institutions were unable to further the cause of research and consultancy. For some of them that were not linked to universities, it was hard to earn the prestige and authority necessary to gain access to government agencies and top administrators in order to do research or offer advice.

(3) The limited impact on performance may have been due in paart to a lack of fit between the model of public administration being exported from the United States and the local environment and needs of LDCs.

The United Nations Division of Development Administration (UNDDA) currently has nearly 300 experts in the field assisting different LDC governments in PAMT. It administers 300 overseas training fellowships annually to nationals of LDCs under various schemes of assistance. Its annual budget for assistance in PAMT to LDCs has grown from $500,000 in 1950 to $12.5 million in 1981. According to UNDDA, the demand for PAMT from LDC governments has been steadily growing, although priorities have shifted from time to time. For example, during the decade of the 1950s, LDC governments focused on modernization and indigenization of public service. In the 1960s, development administration attracted greater attention. It was during this period, that regional institutions and centers were established under UN auspices. According to UNDDA, interest is shifting from middle-level training to senior-level training in LDCs, especially in Latin America. A recent UN project to strengthen international collaboration among institutions in this field testifies to this trend.81/ The demand for in-service training in UN-supported projects continues to be on specialized functions such as budgeting, personnel, and organization and methods. There has also been a tendency, of late, to move away from the use of the lecture method to one based more on practical experience.

Despite the expansion of PAMT institutions in LDCs, UNDDA's assessment is that there are several important gaps and problems.82/ First, the availability and quality of trainers continue to be a major source of concern. Second, the focus of training is still academic rather than oriented toward employment; the result is that PAMT institutions have weak links with cleint organizations. Several university schools and departments of public administration, in particular, face this problem. Third, research and consultancy have not been adequately developed along with PAMT. Part of the problem may be due to the lack of access to data on government-related problems which PAMT institutions face. The overall assessment of PAMT institutions has been summed up in a recent UN report as follows:

> "Training institutions have in many cases also functioned in relative isolation from the actual problems and needs of the public services and this factor explains the diminishing scale of influence of some of the institutes and schools of administration. These institutions have not generally moved as fast as they should to respond to the changing demands. They have not been able to be of great help to the public services while the latter were being transformed from general systems to specialized subsystems."83/

The Development Assistance Committee of the OECD recently completed a comprehensive review of its training assistance focusing mainly on the fellowship schemes. While noting that training assistance has played an important role in developing skilled personnel and upgrading institutions in LDCs, the review also highlighted some of the problems.84/

(1) There is a strong tendency for overseas fellowships to be allocated to the elite - namely those at senior levels in the public service. This may strengthen the capacity of those at the top, but does not assist in building up the middle and lower levels in the bureaucracy. This is partly a problem of the general educational systems in LDCs which are not effective in preparing junior staff for public service jobs.

(2) The neglect of the training component in development projects. It was felt that project-related training should induce donors to work with and strengthen the permanent training structure of the recipient countries.

(3) Limited effectiveness of training is in part due to the poor utilization of existing institutions in LDCs. The need is not to multiply the number of institutions, but rather to improve the effectiveness of the existing ones.

The World Bank is relatively new to technical assistance in training in comparison to other donor agencies. Its present involvement in training is dominated by project-related training which has expanded sixfold in the past six years. A recent review of the Bank's experience in this area has noted that the effectiveness of its work in training has improved substantially.84/ The findings of this review highlight several areas in which further improvements are needed.

(1) The impact of training can be augmented if the Bank adopts a longer term institutional development perspective rather than an exclusive preoccupation with the short-term horizon of project implementation.

(2) In several projects, training effectiveness was hampered by the failure to assess training needs in advance. Training results were poor when requirements were considered only during the phase of project implementation.

(3) When projects gave low priority to training and the Bank's supervision missions ignored training, the effectiveness of training was reduced. In projects where the monitoring of training programs was weak, project-related training was less successful.

(4) The Bank's failure to allocate adequate manpower to deal with training has led to the staff neglecting this area. The Bank's long-term commitment to training should be matched by appropriate action to strengthen its staff resources to manage this activity in the field.

Scholarly Assessments

William Siffin sums up four important lessons of the technical assistance experiences in PAMT.85/ First, during the 1950s and 1960s, public administration was transferred more readily across national and cultural boundaries, especially the budgetary and financial technologies. In the technological field it was possible to institutionalize arrangements consistent with the values of rationality, even when the larger bureaucracy did not subscribe to such values. Second, the availability and attractiveness of technologies may have encouraged their misuse because technologies do not include criteria for determining whether or not to use them. Third, efforts to transfer technologies seem to have focussed more on maintenance needs than on developmental needs. Fourth, the dominant preoccupation with tools and technologies of administration which were exported to LDCs through education and training led to the neglect of development problems.

According to Siffin, the cumulative impact of these factors culminated in the following development in LDCs:84/

> "Today - after two decades of building institutes and other arrangements for public administration, education, training, research, and consultancy - business schools, industrial engineering schools, and economic development institutes are preferred instruments of education and training for managers and desginers of programs and projects in developing countries. This is unfortunate. These alternative instruments are unlikely to address the essentials of the training and education agenda."86/

Bernard Schaffer, in his study of training institutions in India, Kenya, Pakistan, Philippines, Turkey and Zambia points out that, in general, these institutions performed poorly as catalysts for administrative reforms and innovation. He notes that though training played a useful role in he indigenization of the Public Service in East Africa, the new training institutions failed to forge effective linkages with their clientele. Training institutions in the countries he surveyed were "marginal institutions." But he also recognizes the inherent problems in evaluating their impact.

> "If training were only about the inculcation of specific bits of knowledge and skill, then we could evaluate how far the inculcation had occurred, for example, for formal examinations. But we cannot evaluate what the training has done for changed administrative performance and what that will mean in the whole situation. This is the heart of the difficulty. If no claims for change are being made about administrative training done in institutions in the new states, then it is difficult for any to see why they are there or should be there. So we shall see instance after instance of where just such claims are therefore made. But when we are dealing with administrative training which claims appropriate attitudinal change we come up against severe evaluation difficulties, particularly when the administrative training institution itself is left to do the evaluation. The reformist ideology of goals and change assists the acceptability of training institutions and their own official evaluations. But, at the same time, it makes the evaluation process political. Those who discuss evaluation even in simpler situations admit the difficulties. Few actual practitioners of administrative training in developing societies would make easy assumptions about the transfers which flow from administrative training even if other commentors are more sanguine."87/

In a more recent evaluation of public management training in African countries, Schaffer observed that the existing network of training institutions is likely to become moribund and irrelevant unless new modes of training are adopted.88/ He notes that the training and socialization of administrators was preoccupied with the permanent, highly regarded, elite public management cadre. The major problems of African training, in Schaffer's assessment, are (1) the poor utilization and low throughput in several institutions and the move toward more academic training; (2) the increasing inter-generational rivalries which seem to be aggravated by the hierarchical and generalist trends reinforced by the training models; (3) the failure of training institutions to grapple with the real problems of the client groups (especially sectoral and decentralized government agencies and programs); and (4) the lack of innovation in post-entry training, and the virtual absence of any mid-career remedial training and high-level policy-related training.

Assessment of Training by LDC Governments

There have been a number of recent country studies in which senior officers or managers concerned with training have attempted a critical review of the national training efforts, their impact and problems. The findings of the reports on Bangladesh, India, Malaysia, Nepal, Pakistan, the Philippines and Sri Lanka in Asia and Kenya and Nigeria in Africa are presented here; the evidence, however, is partial and not representative of the entire third world.89/

First, all the country reviews confirm that training activities and institutional capacities have expanded significantly in recent years. However, the training facilities at the ministry level and the field level are inadequate when compared with the central training institutions in terms of both quantity and quality. Studies of India, the Philippines, and Kenya have made references to this problem.

Second, a major problem area is the evaluation of training itself. There is dissatisfaction with the present practice of evaluating training effectiveness solely on the basis of feedback provided by participants at the end of each training program. The APDAC studies of India, Malaysia, Pakistan and the Philippines have referred to this lack of attention to training evaluation as a major gap, so has the Commonwealth Secretariat survey of training in LDCs. Despite the dissatisfaction, evaluators confess that suitable methodologies for assessing the broader impact of training are simply not available.

Third, the impact of training is certainly weakened by the inability of governments to link training to career planning and promotion policies. Receptivity to training is greatly hampered by the lack of political and bureaucratic support to strengthen such linkages.

Fourth, the effectiveness of training is reduced by the inappropriate manner in which training needs are assessed. In part, this ineffectiveness is a result of the low priority attached to training by government agencies. But an inappropriate assessment of needs tends to compound the problem by generating training programs which do not meet the real needs of participants. The ECA Report of the Meeting of Ministers and APDAC studies highlight the severity of this problem.

Fifth, there is a serious problem of poor quality in training. Country evaluators confess that a major criticism of public servants is that PAMT tends to be academic. The dominance of the lecture method in most training programs, the neglect of field research to produce indigenous training materials, and undue reliance on foreign textbooks, concepts, and approaches have contributed to this repeated indictment of ongoing training activities. A recent IASIA study and Commonwealth Secretariat surveys indicate that these features are found in most LDCs.90/

Sixth, a critical constraint on the effectiveness of training is attributed to the shortage and low quality of trainers. All countries report this to be a major problem and one which has been aggravated by the hiring practices and incentive structures of the institutions. Most institutions either have academics who are innocent of real world experience and field problems, or practitioners on secondment who have only a short-term interest in the training assignment. The tradition of defense training institutions which attract outstanding officers to teach and manage training activities seems to be virtually absent in the civilian training establishment.

In the public service, if training is perceived to be a "low status" activity, the motivation to undergo training or to be posted in a training institution will understandably be low. If neither good administrators nor good administrators nor good academics find it attractive to work in a training institution, training quality and effectiveness are bound to suffer. Sometimes, top administrators, who themselves never benefited from any training are reluctant to support and nurture this activity.

Malaysia is the only country which has reported improvements in some of these problems areas. Its more systematic training needs assessment, policies linking career development to training, special attention to the upgrading of trainers and attempts to combine research, consultancy, and training are factors that have led to improved training effectiveness. Even so, Malaysia's central training institute has been able to fill only 63% of its approved staff strength.

It is difficult to say whether the results of these country reviews fit the experience of other Asian, African and Latin American countries. The countries reviewd in this paper are certainly among the pioneers in the third world in developing their institutional capacities for training. Nevertheless, Schaffer's assessment of public management training in Africa and some of the findings of donor agencies, such as the Ford Foundation and Commonwealth Secretariat, lend some suport to the hypothesis that the pattern of problems and the barriers to effectiveness listed in the preceding paragraphs are common in many third world countries.

The Lessons of Evaluation

The perspective, timing, and orientations of the evaluation studies reviewed earlier vary a great deal. Some studies have examined the early experiences of institution building and training in LDCs, while others have focused on more recent experiences. Donors have based their judgments on the projects they financed and evaluated their performance against shorter-term time horizons than countries are likely to adopt. Independent scholars have evaluated impact in much broader terms than the managers of training in government; the latter have confined their attention to the network of institutions for which they are responsible.

Despite their diversity, one theme that runs through most of the assessments is that the impact and effectiveness of training in LDCs have not matched the institutional capacity that has been created during the past three decades. LDC governments and their managers of training, donor agencies, and independent observers are agreed upon the existence of a wide gap between expectations and achievements, even if they are not agreed on the answers.

The purpose in reviewing the foregoing studies on the impact of training is not to pronounce a verdict on the record of the donors and LDC governments, rather, it is to highlight the lessons learnt from experience; these are presented below. The first three lessons offer guidelines which are largely within the capacity of training institutions to internalize and apply. The remaining three call for intervention by the government in terms of policy decisions and support to institutions.

(1) If the training needs and training programs are evaluated skillfully, considerable improvement in the efficiency and effectiveness of training can be achieved.

Malaysia's experience clearly brings this point out. The system of requiring government departments to submit annual training bids to the Central Training and Career Development Division and the establishment of an advisory board for INTAN (the National Institute of Public Administration) were ways of improving training needs assessment. Bringing back participants and their supervisors to the Institute for evaluation a year after completion of training was an improvement over the survey of participants by questionnaire at the conclusion of their training. The World Bank's recent experience with project-related training reaffirms this point: when training needs of projects were assessed in advance, and training component was closely monitored and reviewed, the effectiveness of the training was found to be greater.

(2) Increased attention to the problems of client and greater willingness to facilitate learning rather then teaching tend to augment the impact of training.

The basic problem with the earlier U.S. export of public administration training models was not merely that the knowledge and focus were not always appropriate to developing countries, but that the training mode was less adaptable to changing needs and was ill equipped to cope with the problems of practitioners. The experience of American universities was largely with pre-entry education of the degree type and much less with in-service training. On the other hand, the major need of LDCs was in upgrading the capacity of those at work. The problems and requirements of those at work were clearly different from those of inexperienced youngsters in the classroom. Inadequacies of the imported model in responding to both "maintenance" and "development" needs are evident in LDCs. There is no reason to believe that PAMT did a better job on the maintenance front than on development. This was in part due to the inherent limitations of the training modes and methodologies used and the failure to distinguish between "teaching" and "learning". The criticism of the lecture method and the theoretical bias in training repeatedly referred to in country studies highlight this problem.

In contrast, while some of the better management schools in some LDCs also brought in concepts and tools from abroad, they were more effective in training, perhaps, because they paid more attention to their clients and to the use of learning methods more appropriate to their clients' needs. The focus on the problems of the decisionmaker, the application of concepts and tools to solving problems and the creation of strong link with the real world outside through field research and consultancy are features that seem to have increased the relevance of their training. The OECD's assessment that training should be based more on experience and made less academic reflects this concern. Several institutions in Asia, Africa and Latin America which have experimented with approaches combining field research, action, and training have reported encouraging results. These experiences are reviewed in a later section.

(3) A long-term perspective on the development of training capacity is essential even when planning a short-term development project.

This lesson comes through clearly from the experience of the OECD group and the World Bank. Leaving the training component to the short-term oriented experts who join a project has been found to be an ineffective way of going about institution building, particularly in countries plagued by severe manpower shortages as in much of Africa.

(4) The design and management of training institutions and the approach to the development and motivation of faculty trainers will have a strong influence on training effectiveness.

Problems of staffing and deficiencies in institutional management are factors which reduce the effectiveness of training institutions. Government controlled training institutions are particularly susceptible to the inhibiting influence of civil service regulations which are often mindlessly applied. Civil servants who are appointed for short periods as trainers and academics whose development is ignored over long periods will have little motivation to perform and innovate. To be effective, these institutions need an environment that supports innovation, experimentation, and a collegial atmosphere. The quality and continuity of the leaders who manage these institutions also constitute an essential feature of effectiveness. The case of INTAN in Malaysia shows how the government's careful attention to the selection of its director paid off in terms of building it as a viable institution. Here is a case where the incumbent director was given the promotion due to him in his cadere without having to move on to another job. In most countries, one reason for the chief executive's short tenure is that he can get his promotion only by moving on to another job. The problems of institutional management are examined in greater detail in the following section.

(5) When high priority is given to training by government and adequate resources are allocated to strengthen the institutions, training effectiveness is likely to improve.

In Kenya, Malaysia, Nigeria and the Philippines implementation of some key recommendations of government-appointed committees on training led to a significant improvement in the training infrastructure and expansion of training activities. Similarly, raising the status of trainers and those who manage the institutions will signify the priority government attaches to this function. Outstanding officers should be encouraged and even required to serve in a training institution as part of their career development. Both political and bureaucratic leadership must first recognize training as an important task. It is not that high-level policy decisions automatically leads to action. On the other hand, it is a necessary condition for effectiveness and mobilization of resources for training.

Among developed countries, both Japan and the United States have enacted legislation, provided financial support and adopted other policy interventions to promote and sustain training on a long-term basis. In Japan, it is reported that nearly 25% of the federal public employees receive some form of training every year and that employees at lower levels receive as much opportunity for training as any other group.91/ In the U. S. and Japan, governments currently spend nearly 1% of their total federal salary bills on public service training.92/ While this in no way reflects the quality or impact of training, it does show that the more developed countries whose public employment rate of growth is much slower than that of LDCs are willing to allocate substantial resources for human resource development.

In the private sector, corporations are known to attach high priority to their training activities. A recent ILO study shows that large multinational corporations (MNCs) such as Nestles, Siemens, and Unilevers, spent 2.6%, 4.8% and 5% respectively of their total payroll on employee training.93/ It is significant that these MNCs pay careful attention to the training needs of all levels of employees. It is recognized that without training for all levels, the synergistic effects of this input on productivity cannot be achieved. According to the ILO study, training activities are carefully monitored and evaluated by MNCs.

In contrast, it will be difficult to find systematic data on training in many LDC governments. For example, data on the number of employees trained, number of mandays spent on training, and total expenditure on public service training are seldom reported in country reviews and evaluation studies. The Government of Malaysia currently spends 2.75% of its total salary bill on public service training.94/ The only other available reference to training expenditures relates to India, which according to one report, incurred a total domestic training cost equivalent to 0.4% of its total salary bill for public service training in 1968.95/ Indicators of the size and relative importance of training budgets, extent of coverage in terms of personnel, trends in staff resources allocated to training, and so forth are seldom regarded by most LDC governments as relevant and helpful in planning and monitoring this important instrument of human resource development. This is not to deny the importance of qualitative aspects of training performance. Both are valuable aids and complement each other.

(6) The effectiveness of training tends to improve when career planning and development and other personnel policies are closely integrated with training.

In the absence of this condition, negative consequences result for training. Some observers have also stressed the need for political and bureaucratic commitment in facilitating the integration between training and personnel policies. Business enterprises, for instance, are known for paying systematic attention to this sensitive linkage. The discipline of the market place, perhaps, puts greater pressure on enterprises to treat the career development needs of their employees more seriously and use training both as a means of motivating them and equipping them to perform their jobs well. The military's tradition of linking career development with training could also be explained in terms of the profession's strong performance orientation. The failure of the civilian bureaucracy to show a similar concern for performance orientation is at the heart of the problem in most LDCs. In retrospect, it appears that the overoptimistic expectations of donors about the potential effectiveness of training in LDCs in the 1950s were due, partly, to an inadequate appreciation of the complexity of this problem in the public sector.

VI. DESIGN AND MANAGEMENT OF TRAINING INSTITUTIONS

Inadequacies in the staffing and management of training institutions have been recognized as a major problem in developing countries. The inability to attract, motivate, and retain competent staff; frequent changes in leadership; and a limited capacity to plan, organize, and control institutional tasks are some of the other problems. An important lesson of this widely shared experience is that the design and management of PAMT institutions in LDCs are as relevant to their effectiveness as the content and quality of their services. In fact, the content and quality of training cannot but be influenced by the strategy and style of institutional management. In the international survey of 118 PAMT institutions, cited earlier, the need to develop and upgrade faculty has been ranked as the most urgent problem by the vast majority of the institutions.96/ Schaffer has highlighted the tendency of the African public management training institutions to become moribund and weak in their linkages with client groups.97/ A regional study has noted that institutions that were too narrowly tied down to the existing power structure failed to become sources of innovation.98/ When public administration institutes are under substantial government control, they tend to conform to ministerial directions and avoid experimentation and risks that are so essential to the process of educational innovation.

Diverse Approaches to Institutional Development

Because training institutions have been established in LDCs under different auspices and influences, the approaches to institution building also vary widely: three approaches are presented here. First, when a government sets up a training institution and manages it departmentally, the normal tendency is to transfer government's administrative system and practices to the new organization. Thus, recruitment of trainees, distribution of authority, decisionmaking processes, and financial regulations may be based on government's practices whcih may be quite inappropriate to the institution concerned. The establishment of such practices and systems in the early stages have a long-term impact on the way the institution will be managed.

The second approach is that of an institution spawned by a university; in this case, the operating culture of the university casts a dominant influence on the institution's management. If the university itself is highly bureaucratic and centralized in its management, it is unlikely that the new department will be given any autonomy or allowed to experiment with new ways of planning and organization. The poor performance of some university departments of administration can be attributed to the inadequacies of their approaches to institutional development in their formative years.

Evidence of the third approach is found in the establishment of several autonomous institutions. Whether established under public or private auspices, these institutions show a more sensitive understanding of the management systems and practices required for their proper functioning even though, at times, the concept of autonomy has remained nominal. Much depends also on who the initial sponsors or collaborators are; the latter may sometimes unwillingly transfer to the new institutions designs and approaches to management that are basically irrelevant. This may have happened in some of the early collaborations in which U.S. schools of public administration designed and developed new university departments in LDCs in their own image to impart pre-entry training whereas the most important local need was for in-service training which needed a different design and management style.

Similarly when donor agencies collaborate with local institutions they tend to influence the latter's design and management. A diversity of approaches may be necessary, but the basic question to ask is whether the approach selected will contribute to institution building. An inappropriate institutional culture can be transferred by appointing persons from other working cultures with different values. Thus, in some LDCs, the appointment in key positions, or in large numbers at lower positions, of competent government officials whose experience is chiefly derived from routine administration in new research and training institutions or industrial enterprises has created many problems.99/ A study of public administration training in Jordan and Saudi Arabia notes that the training institutions which are part of the University system are inhibited by excessive centralization and an environment inhospitable to research, free expression, and exchange of ideas.100/ The same study reports that environments and performance of the autonomous institutes in these countries are somewhat better. Examples of this type could be found in all parts of the world.

All PAMT institutions in LDCs are not necessarily managed inefficiently. But the problem is sufficiently serious to warrant special attention. The ILO has proposed that the process of strategic planning and management in institutions should be strengthened;101/ this is not an area in which standard remedies can be prescribed for all. A good understanding of the institution's goals, environment, constraints, and resources is an essential prerequisite for the identification and choice of suitable strategies. One useful device some countries have adopted is to appoint special committees to look into the problems of selected institutions and recommend new strategies. The Kenya Government's Committee of Review into the Kenya Institute of Administration (1978-79) and the Indian Government's Review Committee for the Indian Institutes of Management (1981-82) are examples of this approach. In other cases, external technical assistance has been sought by governments to remedy deficiencies in specific aspects of management.

Two management training institutions which have been widely judged by outside observers as high performers are the Indian Institute of Management, Ahmedabad (IIMA) and the Asian Institute of Management, Manila (AIM).102/ IIMA was founded in 1962 and AIM in 1968. Both were established primarily for the purpose of education and training in business administration but soon diversified into the field of public management. The major organizational features identified as common to these institutions are the following:

1. Organizational Form . The Government of India was responsible for the establishment of IIMA, whereas AIM was established as a private-sector institution. In spite of government sponsorship, however, IIMA operated with a substantial measure of autonomy, much like AIM. The important feature was the absence of inflexible government control rather than the specific structural form. Both institutes had the required autonomy to carry out the evolutionary and flexible programs that were critical to the changing needs of their environment. In IIMA's case, the government monitored its progress through a Board of Governors on which it was well represented. The institute, in part, augmented its autonomy through its own performance, and the diversification of its sources of funding. Government sponsorship provided legitimacy to IIMA which may be described as a joint venture between government and industry.

2. Focus on Multiple, but Related Tasks. Both institutes were engaged in training, research, and consulting with a mutually reinforcing relationship among these related tasks. The vitality of teaching in these institutes has been sustained by the linkages that research and consulting provided with practising managers in both private and public sectors. Such linkages have been particularly effective in collaborating with government agencies for improving systems and practices through long-term arrangements of three to five years. Management of these multiple tasks is more complex than that of training as a single activity. Groups of faculty members with responsibility for different tasks were set up to ensure accountability for results. Close contacts with client groups reinforced their performance orientation.

3. Educational Model. Both IIMA and AIM started with a fairly well defined model of business enterprise management that had a good measure of conceptual coherence. With an established record of success in this field, they were able to expand into the field of public management through a process of adaptation and learning. The tradition of pulling together several relevant disciplines and applying knowledge to solving problems in the organizational context are strengths of the model on which they have built further.

4. Leadership and Internal Decisionmaking. One of the widely shared generalizations about building organizations is the role of leadership. Though both institutions had foreign collaboration during the initial period, they also had local leaders from the beginning who were able to establish a sense of purpose and direction in these organizations. These people had the stature and ability to establish the organizations' legitimacy in the unique political and cultural setting of their countries.

5. A Critical Mass of Faculty. The size of the faculty built up in these institutes was large compared to that of university departments engaged in comparable activities. Too small a group seldom develops the critical mass needed to undertake multidisciplinary activities and experimentation. IIMA has ninety and AIM forty members on their faculty. Internal organizational structures, however, did not become hierarchical. On the other hand, their methods of internal planning and decision-making are participatory in nature. The practice of hiring temporary faculty on secondment is uncommon. Investment

in faculty development and motivation through performance evaluation are some of the important features.

A combination of events, persons, and strategies which lead to success in one situation cannot always be repeated elsewhere. However, Kamla Chowdhury, who has investigated the development of several other similar institutions in India, observes that the mix of features identified in the preceding paragraphs has been found in other high performers too.103/ For example, the Pan African Institute for Development (PAID), which focuses on rural development training, has four noteworthy features: (1) it has good leadership and linkages with various development agencies in Africa; (2) it enjoys substantial autonomy through its multilateral financing arrangements, some earnings through contract work, and an eventual plan to be wholly African financed; (3) it adopts a tri-dimensional approach which emphasizes multidisciplinary, field research for developing training materials, hands-on field experience in a bottom-up rural development plan for its trainees and staff, and an outreach function at the grassroots level; it is also action oriented which is unique in Africa; and (4) it has a decentralized management so that local adaptation is facilitated at its regional centers.104/ However, PAID needs to augment its limited faculty resources urgently because the demand for its services has been increasing from a variety of African development agencies and governments, and because it tends to lose its staff to other organizations.

Among the fully government-controlled and financed training institutions, INTAN in Malaysia has achieved a reputation for its performance. The usual stereotype that government-run institutions are rigid in their staffing patterns and approaches to training, plagued by instability in leadership, and consequent neglect of their internal management, does not fit INTAN. Its organizational and management features are more akin to those highlighted of other good performance institutions in the preceding pages: (1) Though controlled by the government, INTAN was given an autonomous status by the government not only in operating its own budget, but in planning and managing its activities. It has an advisory board to advise on the training requirements and programs. (2) Government has given special attention to its leadership. Its director reports directly to the head of the Public Services Department. His selection is done at the highest level and the convention has been that he should complete at least a full term of five years. Staff members too are carefully selected and sent out for higher-level training. Upon return, they are required to stay for at least a full term of five years at INTAN. A number of civil servants (with specialized training) on the faculty stay on for much longer periods. (3) Though INTAN initially was engaged only in training, it is now more active in research, development of teaching materials and consultancy work. A concept of "action training" has been introduced that blends classroom training with action interventions on the job and in the field. Faculty development is given high priority and heavy investments have already been made.105/

There is evidence that those who manage government-controlled PAMT institutions in different countries are beginning to recognize the importance of these institutional features. The recent Committee of Review into the Kenya Institute of Administration (KIA), for example, has emphasized the need for giving KIA "the widest possible latitude in its operations" and argued for strengthening its "contacts and relations with client organizations."106/ The Development Academy of the Philippines has also moved towards institutionalizing the mix of features discussed in the preceding pages. In Latin America, the Brazilian Institute of Public Administration, INCAE (The Central American Institute of Business Administration) in Nicaragua, and IESA (Institute de Estudios Superiores de Administration) in Caracas have incorporated the management features outlined earlier.107/

An important area that often gets neglected is the role of motivation and incentives in improving institutional performance. Compensation policies are critical in this regard. Even though the private sector usually is more flexible in offering moentary compensation as an incentive than government-run training institutions, the latter have, in some cases, introduced innovations in this area. Some institutions offer additional payments when faculty members do consulting work; they have increased the number of posts thereby improving promotion possibilities; accelerated increments are also given to the faculty who perform outstandingly. Since there are limits to monetary incentives, institutions can seek other approaches to motivate their staff. First, several institutions have found an annual performance appraisal of the faculty a useful device to review their output and also to provide them with feedback on their performance. When promotions are based only on seniority and performance inputs are ignored, institutional performance suffers. Second, the periodic evaluation can be a basis for offering nonmonetary incentives, such as recognition of a person's work by the institution, new oportunities for self-development, and nominations to prestigious positions. Third, the management style of the leader and the faculty's role in internal decisionmaking also may contribute to better motivation. A professional organization's performance depends on the extent to which it uses the ideas and collaborative efforts of its staff. The motivation to innovate and collaborate will be strong when the staff is encouraged to participate in the process of institution building.

The ILO refers to the process of creating and sustaining this mix of institutional features as "strategic management". The ILO study presents many examples of how pro-active institutions in different parts of the world practice strategic management through a process of defining, redefining, and implementing their basic choices concerning purpose and goals, target sectors and client groups, and resource allocation.108/ They also match their internal organizational structures to the chosen tasks and create planning and monitoring systems to improve the performance of these tasks. There is a need for strategic decisions and actions at the institutional level to be reinforced by good team work by the staff and supported by continuing and close attention to detailed planning and monitoring of individual activities.109/

VII. RECENT DEVELOPMENTS IN TRAINING

The focus, scope, and methods of training in public administration have undergone important changes in developing countries during the past three decades. This evolution has been influenced by the shifts in focus which have occurred in western countries as well as by the changing needs and challenges of LDCs. Certainly, the pattern of evolution has not been identical in all parts of the third world, nor have been the responses of training institutions to these changes. The significance of these recent developments in PAMT are examined in this chapter.

Shifts in Conceptual Approaches

Public administration training has been influenced by different disciplines in the course of its evolution. As pointed out in Chapter II, in the colonial era, the French system of training was dominated by the legal tradition, whereas the British system was based on a generalist concept that emphasized the study of diverse subjects such as political economy, history and the classics.110/ An important shift took place during the 1920s when a broader approach to public administration which drew upon the concepts of "social sciences" and "scientific management" emerged in the United States. This model of public administration training was adopted by many LDCs during the 1950s; it emphasized certain general principles of public administration and specific functions and tools such as public budgeting and accounting, organization and methods, and personnel systems and practices. In effect, this approach was superimposed in many LDCs on their inherited legal orientation or generalist tradition in training.

The emergence of a large number of independent LDCs during the 1950s and 1960s led to a new set of concerns in the field of development. Public servants were needed to be well grounded in the concepts and practice of macro-planning and project forumulation. PAMT institutions responded by offering training programs in these areas. The disciplines of economics, operations research and management provided new inputs to the training curricula. Conceptual developments in cost-benefit analysis and macro- and micro-level model building facilitated this new trend. Donor agencies reinforced this project-performance orientation as they were involved in financing and promoting development projects and programs.111/ The new wave of training was an overlay on the existing general and functional types of training which many LDC institutions continued to provide. It is difficult to assess the magnitude of this additional load. In India, for example, it is reported that about a third of the training of the training programs organized by the Central Personnel Division during the 1970s focussed on specialized, development-related subjects.112/ In most degree programs of public administration institutes, these specialized subjects were added to the curricula. There is no reason to believe that the new emphasis on development administration and project-related training displaced the traditional focus on general and functional training for the central system of government.

A new trend which aas yet to make a dent on the curricula and concepts of training in the established PAMT institutions is the action learning approach that has surfaced in the training of personnel engaged in rural and social development. The dissatisfaction with the conventional economic growth strategies of the 1960s which, by and large, failed to solve the problems of mass poverty triggered off a variety of programs and projects in integrated rural development. To improve the performance of these slow-moving programs, a process-oriented, action-learning approach has been experimented with in some LDCs. The concept and methodology of this approach differs significantly from those of most conventional training programs. It recognizes that the design and management requirement of the new-style projects in such areas as nutrition, health, and education are very different from those of the conventional economic and physical infrastructure projects. The latter can be pre-designed fairly precisely and implemented in the field according to plan, but for rural development programs this blueprint approach has little relevance. For such rural development programs, the answer lies in making project implementors and project beneficiaries to work together to achieve common goals in an "action learning mode."113/ Training, under this mode, is not viewed as an isolated and discrete activity, but as one which occurs in the process of action in the field, a process in which all the relevant actors apply their knowledge and generate answers together. It may have a classroom component, but does not presume a "trainer" who imparts knowledge or skills to the "trainees".

The intellectual moorings of this approach can be traced to the new developments in "learning theory" pioneered by leading psychologists and their applications in the fields of education, industry, and social change. Kurt Lewin, B. F. Skinner, and others have contributed to the theoretical and practical applications including action research, organization development and behavior modification.114/ Lewin, who was known as a "practical theorist," demonstrated through his research on a number of practical problems that group discussion and creation of commitment to action through group consensus were more effective in achieving desired behavioral changes than merely resorting to explanations and lectures. The application of action learning to other countries can be restricted by cultural factors. Those who have practised organization development and T-Group training in LDCs have faced severe problems of adaptation when local conditions and values were not adequately taken into account. Patterns of authority, interpersonal relationships, and values and norms governing communication and social behavior are factors relevant to all societies, but the mix and priorities may vary from one milieu to another. Hence the proper identification of the pattern that prevails in a given setting is a necessary condition for the effectiveness of this approach.

Several examples of this approach and its variants exist in different parts of the third world. In 1974, the Public Systems Group of the Indian Institute of Management, Ahmedabad (IIMA), initiated a long-term project to integrate field research, advisory work, and training to bring about organizational change through a process of mutual learning. In the Philippines, the Asian Institute of Management (AIM) and Ford Foundation have been engaged in a similar project with the National Irrigation Agency. With USAID support, an action-learning mode of training has been attempted in a number of LDC organizations, including Tanzania's Rural Development Bank, for the training of trainers and Jamaica's integrated rural development project. In Malaysia, INTAN has experimented with action training in its regular training program for young administrators. The World Bank has also used this approach in the development of the Agricultural Management Training Institute in Bangladesh.

One variant of this approach is the Performance Improvement Program, which the ILO has used for public enterprises, especially in East Africa and in

Nigeria. Most of the experience with this new approach to training has been generated by institutions other than the one involved in conventional public administration training. This approach is being used to improve the effectiveness of projects and programs in rural development as conventional training concepts were relatively slow or unable to cope with. The evidence on these experiments, however, is limited to draw any useful conclusions.

Changes in the Targets and Methods of Training

The legal and generalist traditions of training focussed on elite administrators which the social sience-based approach included a larger segment of the public service. Specialists and functional officers, in addition to general administrators, were also part of the audience. As increased attention was given to the planning and management of projects, the target group was widened to cover field project personnel such as planners and project managers. Public enterprise managers charged with the implementation of developmental and quasi-commercial tasks also came within the purview of PAMT training. Even so, the focus was on the "individual" and the development of his skills, attitudes, and ability to perform the defined tasks. Some attention to team work and group performance was given as the focus of training shifted to project management concerns.

The recent experiments with the action-learning approach have shifted the focus of training from the individual to the organization. The target is no longer the individual or persons in the same level or category, but all members of the organization who are relevant to the total performance. The involvement of multiple organizational levels and of implementors and beneficiaries are seen as essential to the process of learning from joint action.

A recent survey of PAMT institutions in different parts of the world shows that the lecture method still dominates training.115/ However, another survey - one by the Commonwealth Secretariat - finds there is no single dominant method of training in most of its member countries.116/ It presents evidence that different methods such as case studies, exercises, syndicates, role playing, games, and so forth are in vogue, and that the responding institutions have found T-group training and programmed instruction among the least useful methods. None of the surveys, however, refers to the use of action learning as a method.

An important point that emerges from the study of the literature is that teaching methodologies associated with the conventional approaches - legal generalist and social science - continue to dominate even though significant shifts have occurred in the concepts and tasks of training. The Commonwealth Secretariat survey probably points to the emergence of a shift in the mix of methods being used in some countries. Thus, it is likely that a shift in focus toward project appraisal and project management training would lead to a more analytic rather than a descriptive emphasis in teaching and possibly increased the use of field work, group projects, and problem solving methods. The development of indigenous teaching materials, however, is a prerequisite for the use of these methods, but unfortunately these materials are lacking. In terms of the action-learning approach, the methodologies used are vastly different from what most PAMT institutions are used to. So, to adopt this methodology, PAMT institutions will have to make major internal changes, both conceptual and organizational.

Several other training institutions too have attempted new experiments in training managers for selected sectors. The Commonwealth Secretariat, for example, is currently engaged in the promotion of a major training of trainers program for African countries and the Ljubljana International Center in Yugoslavia has developed OPTIMA, a program that blends diagnostic exercises and training for public enterprises.

In summing up this review, it is important to highlight the different phases in the evolution of PAMT in LDCs and their problems of adaptation over time. Though these phases do not necessarily follow a uniform sequence in all countries, they, nevertheless, offer useful insights into the potential and problems of adapting training to meet the changing needs of LDCs. A summary of the phases and their key features are presented in Table 7.1 and explained below.

(1) Public service training has drawn upon different approaches and disciplines to meet the developing countries' changing needs during the past three decades. The conventional PAMT institutions were not able to fully generate the theoretical understanding and practical strategies that were needed

Table 7.1

Phases in the Evolution of PAMT

Conceptual Orientation	Task Definition	Target of Training	Method/Mode of Training	Institutional Network
Legal orientation Generalist tradition	Maintenance of status quo	Individual administrators (elites)	Descriptive/ classroom on the job	Special training institution, universities.
Social Science orientation Functional approach	Modernization of the central systems of government	Individual administrators	Descriptive/ theoretical/ classroom oriented	Government training institutions, autonomous public administration centers, university departments.
Macro planning focus Project performance orientation	Designing and managing development plans and projects.	Individuals and small groups of administrators and managers.	Analytic/ technical/ classroom/field work.	Government institutions, universities, public administration centers, management institutes, sectoral institutions, consulting firms.
Action Learning orientation	Decentralized capacity for social/rural development (Sectoral and multisectoral)	Organizations and beneficiary groups.	Collective learning through action/ experiential methods.	Government institutions (limited role), management institutes, sectoral institutions, consulting firms, donors.

to cope with these problems. A strategy adopted by many LDC governments under these circumstances was to widen the network of institutions to meet their expanding and diverse needs of training.

(2) In the evolution of PAMT, the greatest difficulty faced by existing institutions is in anticipating and responding to the training needs of social and rural development. This elite orientation of PAMT institutions, their emphasis on academic and descriptive teaching, and reliance on the classroom method may have limited their ability to respond to the new needs. New modes and methods of training have been innovated largely by other types of institutions.

(3) A new phase in the evolution of LDC training needs does not mean that the needs of the earlier phases have ceased to exist. Each new phase seems to add a new set of tasks to the existing training portfolio. Part of the dilemma facing the institutions is in allocating their limited resources (staff and funds) between the existing and emerging needs of government.

(4) Existing PAMT institutions do not offer inspiring examples of innovation and adaptation except in rare cases. Part of the problem may be traced to the institutional strategies they adopt. There is no doubt, however, that internal mechanisms for encouraging experimentation, interplay of different disciplines, and integration of diverse skills are weak in many PAMT institutions. In the following pages, we describe selected innovations in training to illustrate how some pro-active institutions have responded to new challenges. These examples represent experiments or pilot projects, for the most part. Nevertheless, they may have useful lessons for other institutions.

A. Action-Training in a Government Training Institution

Training for officials engaged in social and rural development programs in Malaysia used to be organized by INTAN, the central government training institution, through lectures in the classroom.117/ The information fed back by participants showed that the impact of such training at the grassroot level was weak because it was unable to focus on the issues relevant to the participants.

INTAN then adopted "action training". Though it uses classrooms, action training places greater emphasis on the practical exercise of identifying the real problems, and finding and implementing solutions to rural development programs through the active involvement of participants. The main features of INTAN's action training for the district of Kuala Selangor were the following:

1. Participants. The program involved the cooption or adoption of an entire district organization. All organization members (officers, supervisors, extension workers and so forth) were participants in the program. Others, such as members of parliament, village leaders, and farmers were also involved.

2. Process. The program was open ended and involved a series of short courses and workshops organized over a three-month to six-moth period. Followup actions were taken in the field and activities were evaluated in the workshops. INTAN's trainers acted as resource persons in this process. The sequence of steps in the process consisted of problem identification, priority determination, recommendations of solutions, action taken, and results achieved. Three workshops were held to identify problems and priorities; their recommendations included formal training of personnel, selected areas of work, research and consultancy on certain problems of agricultural projects, a strategy for project implementation at the district level, and feedback to central agencies on long-term solutions. Action was taken to organize specific courses, introduce changes in administrative procedures in the district, market research on selected local crops, and to interact with district departmental heads on implementation matters. Improvements in the marketing of chicken and coconuts and better systems of project identification and processing were the results reported at the end of the program.

3. Integration. Action training was integrated with the management process since it involved the actual implementation of solutions of problems. As a result, positive patterns of behavior, such as collective action and inter-agency consultation which were nurtured during training, were unconsciously continued by participants in their day-to-day functions after the program. INTAN's pioneering work demonstrates that despite constraints, innovation is not entirely impossible in government-run PAMT institutions.

B. Integration of Research, Consultancy, and Training

assisting government agencies to improve the effectiveness of selected development programs and projcts was pointed out earlier. It was felt that training project and program officers in the conventional manner would be of little avail; a "learning-intervening" mode could be opted in its place. The

Asian Institute of Management, for example, assisted the Philippines Ministry of Agriculture whereas the Indian Institute of Management at Ahmedabad worked with a large government population program in one state in India. The Central American Institute of Business Administration (INCAE) was involved in several rural development projects in its region. The common elements of their strategies were the following:118/

(1) The research was centered on a client's problems; it emphasized the decisionmaker's perspective and gave substantial attention to the organizational process through which actual outcomes where shaped. An important product of research was a set of simple concepts that were useful to public managers in thinking through their problems.

(2) The consulting activities were aimed at augmenting the problem-solving capacities of clients rather than solving problems for clients. Attention in both consulting and training activities were given to improving organizational structures and systems.

(3) Seminars and workshops helped to bring together key personnel from either a single organization or a program agency to focus on both individual skills and team work. Training sessions were designed to contribute to behavioral changes that were identified as important and to test the validity of the findings of ongoing research. Research outputs were fed back into training as training materials and cases in appropriate ways.

C. Performance Planning Improvement in East African Public Enterprises

The program for Performance Planning Improvement (PIP), which draws upon the action-learning approach, was used successfully to improve the performance of four large public enterprises (airways, railways, harbors, and post and telecommunications) in the East African Community. These corporations had to cope with the technological and economic changes caused by the introduction of diesel engines, jumbo jets, containerization, automatic telephone systems, trade union problems, and high rates of inflation. They also had to speed up the Africanization of their staff and promote harmonious functioning despite differences in the political ideologies and systems of the member states.

The role of PIP in one of the four enterprises, the postal and telecommunications organization (PT) is described here.119/ .PT employs over

10,000 persons and given the rapid techno-economic changes it faced in 1970, the big question before its managers was: were they going to successfully manage the change or was the change going to manage them? It was at this stage that the head of PT was exposed to concept of PIP at a top management seminar organized by the UN and ILO. He decided it was worth trying out this concept in his organization.

PIP could be thought of as an organization development program with five phases: preliminary diagnosis, orientation (an introductory workshop for top management), organization and action planning, implementation of the resulting performance improvement plan, and review/revision. These phases could be repeated. In the case of PT, the initial three-day workshop for the top management was extremely useful in winning their commitment and confidence, and formulating preliminary ideas and corporate goals, performance indicators, main problems, and some tentative action programs. This led on to a detailed exercise for organizational diagnosis and action planning with the top management teams from all three regions and headquarters. A series of PIP workshops were then held in the regions with senior managers who were also given a PIP instrument (a work book) which led them systematically through a step-by-step process of diagnosis and action planning. An important finding of the managers during this exercise was that PT lacked the data and management information system required for effectively measuring corporate performance and setting goals. Despite many political problems, the action plans were implemented in the next phase and organizational performance improvements were recorded. Productivity, profitability, and cost reduction were areas in which improvements were noted, according to an evaluation of the program. The challenging target of a 12.5% increase in telephone connections per year was exceeded in the very first year of the implementation phase. Credit for this, of course, cannot be given to PIP alone. Within the corporation, it was felt that PIP had a positive impact on the reactions, learning, and in the behavior of managers at different levels.

The experience of PIP in East Africa has highlighted several conditions which are necessary for a successful change:

- Pressure (both external and internal) for change.
- Strong and committed leadership willing to take a critical look at the organization.

- Expanded participation at several levels in the organization in diagnosis and action planning.
- Invention of new ideas and alternatives.
- Expermentation with new answers, on a small scale to begin with.
- Reinforcement from positive results to ensure extension of the change effort.

Surprisingly, there is no reference to the role of training in this exercise at all. Yet, training is woven into the process in all phases. The workshops, the process of learning to use the PIP work book, joint work on diagnosis, action planning, implementation arrangements and review invariably involve training. The critical difference is that training is not an isolated activity. It is integrated into a performance and change-oriented, organization-based program, and operates in the action-learning mode.

VIII. CONCLUSIONS AND POLICY IMPLICATIONS

The problems and gaps identified during the course of this survey of public administration and management training (PAMT) are so overwhelming that one is likely to lose sight of the positive developments in this field. Therfore, an overview of the positive features are presented here.

There has been a significant expansion in the infrastructure for PAMT in the third world during the past two decades. The total number of training institutions has quadrupled during this period. Though many of the newer and smaller LDCs are yet to create the needed facilities, most others have expanded their institutional capacities for training, first with assistance from donors, but increasingly with their own resources in later periods.

Over the years, the network of training institutions has expanded to include newer types of institutions and modes of training. The establishment of autonomous institutes of administration outside the government, the use of management institutes and sectoral training institutions (for example, for agriculture and rural development), and the trend toward linking project-related training with local institutions are examples of how LDCs have tried to cope with new and changing needs. The establishment of several regional and intergovernmental training institutions, a new trend, is of special significance to the smaller LDCs. This is a positive development, one which more LDCs are likely to follow in the future.

There is growing interest in the formulation of national training policies in many LDCs. In several Asian countries, broad based reviews of public administration systems have led to the formal adoption of training policies for the public service. In Africa, many governments have taken active steps, with the help of ECA, to formulate national training policies as part of a broader strategy to promote human resource development. This is an important step towards setting goals and priorities for PAMT and creating a focal point within government to plan, coordinate, and monitor training activities.

Experiments with newer and more relevant modes of training are taking place in different parts of the third world, often with assistance from donor agencies. One example is the action-learning mode which is being used increasingly in the context of field programs. Its emphasis on linking training to action, performance orientation, and organizational focus are features which have elicited a positive response in LDCs. While it is too early to evaluate the impact of these experiments, they represent a move to make training more relevant to practitioners, particularly in people-oriented development programs.

Areas of Concern

The problems and gaps in PAMT fall into four categories:

(1) *The training infrastructure in LDCs is highly skewed in favor of elites in the public service and, in many cases, the utilization of existing facilities is poor*. Training resources are allocated chiefly to meet the entry-level needs of public servants, and that also of the main administrative cadres. This has led to the relative neglect of in-service training in general, and of the training needs of lower-level personnel In particular. At the same time, the full potential of the existing training infrastructure is not being realized partly because the broader personnel policies of governments (such as the career development linkage with training) are not supportive of training, and partly due to the failure of training designs (curricula, methods, and so forth) to match the real training needs of public servants. This indeed is the great training paradox of the LDCs. In many ways, this phenomenon is strikingly similar to the experience of many LDCs with their past development strategies. Investment in the creation of physical production capacity takes place, but its utilization remains poor, and distribution of benefits skewed in favor of the elites.

(2) *The absence of training policies in most LDCs and the inability on lack of will to implement policy where it exists represent a major area of concern*. *Ad hoc* decisions on training, and inconsistencies of the kind inherent in the training paradox can be traced to this problem to a large extent. The neglect of training needs; the failure to allocate specific training responsibilities to different agencies; and inadequacies in the design, planning, and evaluation of training programs are manifestations of a lack of well-designed training policies. In some LDCs, the lack of adequate skills within government to adapt policy, and guide and monitor its implementation tends to make the implementation and review of policy a difficult task.

(3) Problems of institutional development and management is a major cause of poor training performance. An important lesson is that the design and management of PAMT institutions are as relevant to their effectiveness as the content and quality of their services. These problems are most severe for government-owned training institutions and university related departments or schools of administration which together account for 80% of all PAMT institutions. Inappropriate organizational forms, poor leadership, inadequacies in the educational models followed, lack of attention to faculty development and motivation, and the inability to integrate training with research and consultancy are among the factors associated with poor management of institutions. Evaluation studies show that high performers in this field are few, but that the mix of institutional features which led to their success has important implications for all others. The project-related training (PRT) activities of donors may also have contributed unwittingly to the neglect of the institutional development when PRT is viewed from a purely short-run perspective.

(4) Investment in the physical infrastructure of PAMT has not been matched by an adequate investment in the development of faculty, curricula, training materials, and methodologies. In many institutions, resources have not been provided to build on and adapt the original models, knowledge, and tools borrowed from abroad. As a result, training programs are simply repeated using the same old materials and methods. PAMT requires experimentation and innovation in order to evolve new training designs, materials, and training methods. The key resource for this purpose is the trainer. His status, development, and motivation have generally not been treated as matters of priority. In fact, there is hardly any research and development in PAMT in most LDCs.

The absence of supportive personnel policies which are a precondition for training effectiveness, the lack of well designed national training policies and policy capabilities within government, neglect of institutional development and management, and an inadequate allocation of resources to upgrade the quality and relevance of PAMT are among the central problems which deserve immediate and urgent attention.

Implications for Policy

There are three board areas in which new policy initiatives and actions by LDC governments are called for. First, findings from the survey of PAMT institutions have important implications for the national personnel policies and systems of governments. Second, the findings focus on the urgent need for well designed training policies to provide a framework for planning and managing training activities. Third, policy interventions are important to improve the efficiency and effectiveness of the existing training infrastructure in LDCs. The emphasis should be on those actions that governments can take in the short run to better utilize existing resources and improve the poor performance of some of the training institutions.

Public Personnel Policies and Systems

The personnel policies and systems of LDC governments should reinforce and support public service training activities. The first step towards this end is to establish strong link between the career development plans of public servants and their training. There is considerable evidence to show that when such links are established, training becomes more effective and elicits a more positive response from the trainee. This approach will also facilitate the assignment of personnel to areas in which they have acquired new skills and competence. Of course, to implement this policy successfully, a greater sense of discipline and cooperation is required of all ministries and agencies to work together with the national personnel authority.

Career development plans must be reinforced by promotion policies and performance appraisal systems which take into account inputs on training evaluation. Making training a precondition for promotion often reduces it to a ritual. It is more important to insure that the process of performance appraisal takes into account a person's record on training. When promotion policies, performance evaluation reports, and so forth make no reference to training, it is a clear signal to the public servant being evaluated that training is dispensable.

Systematic monitoring of public service training activities at the national level is essential to keep the heads of government informed of the progress being made in human resource development in the public sector. It should be the responsibility of the personnel agency of the government to collect and prepare key indicators of training inputs and outputs for review by the cabinet or head of government. Summary data on numbers trained, proportion of public servants in different categories and levels being trained, costs of training in relation to the total salary bill of government, and key indicators emerging from evaluative evidence on training could be monitored periodically. Corrective actions can be taken at the top levels in government as well as by training institutions only when such monitoring and feedback are institutionalized.

Seventy-eight countries in the developing world today have a population of less than 5 million each. National policies of these small countries should suport and strengthen regional cooperation in public service training. Since scarce resources and talents are essential for building viable training institutions, it makes sense for these countries with similar problems and cultural and political traditions to pool their resources for training. Research on new training programs, development of indigenous training materials, training of trainers, and consultancy are activities which require large investments and a scale of operations which will be uneconomical for a small country to undertake. Several regional institutions have emerged in response to this need and they deserve the fullest support of LDC governments and donor agencies.

The policy interventions discussed earlier cannot be implemented without a central personnel agency in an LDC government. They also have important implications for other ministries which must collaborate with the personnel agency, and for the ministry of finance or planning which has the responsibility for resource allocation. Training is a function that cuts across ministries and departments. It is for this reason that support for this activity in terms of policies and legislation should emanate from the highest levels in government.

Training Policy: A Framework for Action

There are a variety of reasons why every LDC government ought to formulate and continually review its training policy for the public service. A formal training policy can be an useful aid to identify training needs and set objectives and priorities of a government's training efforts. It will clarify the roles and responsibilities of the different agencies engaged in training and facilitate coordination among them. Though most LDCs today do not have formal training policies, it is encouraging that many are actively engaged in formulating such policies. The following guidelines are being offered as an aid to their policy formulation processes.

A training policy for the public service should specify the objectives and types of training, relating them to the different categories of personnel. Historically, training in LDCs has paid disproportionate attention to the needs of the elite administrative cadres. There is a clear need to broaden the objectives and scope of training so that the needs of all categories of public servants are met adequately.

This makes the task of assessing training needs both urgent and complex. A policy statement ought to emphasize the importance of this task and offer broader guidelines on the subject to the agencies which are made responsible for this function. A variety of methods (surveys, discussions with ministries, job analysis, critical incident method, and so forth) are available from which an agency may choose. But first the agency must take into account the changing strategies of the country's development, new systems and practices introduced into the public service, and the general performance problems of various categories of personnel. The emerging needs may range from general management training for higher level personnel to functional training and basic skills development for other categories. Mechanisms, such as advisory committees and workshops, may be specified in the policy document to facilitate consultations between the personnel or training agencies and the clients.

Training policy should also spell out the institutional arrangements for meeting the training needs as determined from time to time. While no policy can specify the designs of training programs, it is important to offer guidelines on the roles that different institutions should play in meeting different types of needs. For example, wherever the training needs of ministries and statutory bodies are common, centralized planning and organization of training programs for them may be encouraged as a matter of policy. PAMT will fall into this category in most LDCs. Centralization of training should be preferred wherever the knowledge and skills to be imparted are transferrable across sectors and organizations; economy in the use of resources and facilities can be achieved through sharing common facilities; the creation of a critical mass of trainers is essential; and the interchange of ideas and experiences among participants strengthens the learning process. On the other hand, wherever the needs are unique to a ministry or sector, policy may encourage the creation of separate facilities to meet such training needs. Policy guidelines need not be confined to the creation and use of government-owned training facilities. It could well be that universities and other autonomous bodies are assigned responsibilities and resources for certain types of training. In brief, it is the function of policy to define the roles and responsibilities of the network of institutions required to meet the public service training needs, specify the mechanisms for the coordination of their operations, and for monitoring their performance.

Training policy should offer guidelines on the financing of public service training activities. Without adequate financial arrangements, public servants will lack motivation. Government policy should make clear how it will meet costs of training participants at government institutions as well as with their sponsored studies abroad or self-development at home. Overseas training fellowships have often been used haphazardly and with little planning and coordination.

Finally, training policy should offer a set of guidelines on the evaluation of training. Institutions must be asked to evaluate training programs on their own; in addition the central personnel agency should be charged with the responsibility of monitoring and evaluating the performance of all institutions which offer training services to the government. Since evaluation is a complex matter, the policy statement may provide for a periodic review of the performance of government's own training institutions through commissions or task forces made up of respresentatives of user groups and ministries and independent experts. Such mechanisms will not only generate useful ideas for improving training, but also motivate institutions to constantly seek ways and means to improve and innovate.

A training policy is essentially a framework that sets out goals, priorities, and guidelines for action. Depending upon a country's political system, policy may be formalized through an executive order or legislation. Irrespective of the form it takes, it is important for governments as well as public enterprises to recognize the need to review their training policies continually. The task is not merely to declare a training policy, but to develop the capacity within government to design and integrate the various components to ensure their effective implementation.

Utilization of Existing Training Infrastructure

As noted earlier, the network of training institutions in LDCs has expanded significantly in the past three decades, but they are inadequately utilized. Improving the institutions' utilization and effectiveness does not have to wait till the long-term policy initiatives discussed earlier are fully implemented. Where there are problems on the supply side, such as improper assessment of training needs, inadequacies in the quality and motivation of trainers, irrelevance of training materials and methods, and problems in managing training institutions, efficiency and effectiveness could be increased in the short-run through a different set of actions and policy interventions. A reallocation of available resources, restructuring of organizations and marginal additions to investment together may result in significant gains under these conditions.

Payoff through Reallocation of Resources

Even before a comprehensive training policy is formulated, a government may wish to undertake a quick survey of the performance and problems of its existing training programs and infrastructure. Such investigations in a number of countries have brought to light important gaps and imbalances in their existing training efforts, such as for example, an overconcentration of training for the central administrative cadres in most LDCs at the cost of other categories of personnel. The entry-level training also has received a disproportionate share of resources whereas in-service training, particularly for senior-level personnel, has yet to receive the attention it deserves. The development strategies of most LDCs cannot be effectively implemented without imparting appropriate training to public personnel at all levels and at different stages in their careers. Though an increased allocation of resources will be required to cope with these tasks fully, much can be accomplished through a more efficient allocation of existing resources. Thus, a careful review of the long-duration training programs of one to three years for the elite services in some countries may lead to a redesign and reduction in the length of these programs. The resources and time thus saved could be used for the training of other categories of personnel or for more adequate in-service training for the same cadres.

Increased training requirements could be met also by mobilizing the resources of nongovernmental or autonomous institutions such as universities and management training centers. Widening the network of institutions in this manner will require only marginal investments in financial terms. The challenge is more in terms of enlisting their suppport and motivating them to contribute to public service training. In specialized areas such as project formulation and appraisal, project management, and so forth and for part-time training in the functional aspects of public administration, these institutions could be of considerable assistance. The central personnel agency should identify and assess the potential assistance such institutions can offer, forge linkages with them, and provide them support and incentives to participate in the network of public service training institutions.

Qualitative Barriers to Training Effectiveness

There are many actions that governments can take to minimize the qualitative barriers to training effectiveness. The problms include improper assessment of training needs, poor quality and motivation of trainers, inappropriate training designs and materials, weak training methodologies, and inadequacies in training evaluation. Unfortunately, investment in the physical infrastructure of institutions has often received much higher priority than the task of dealing with these critical problems.

Table 8.1

Interventions For Better of Utilization of Existing Training Infrastructure

Ingredients of Training Strategy to be Influenced	Policy Interventions/Actions	Key Actors of Initiators	Nature of Resource Requirements
Assessment of training methods	Strengthen consultations between the central personnel agency (CPA) and other ministries; choose appropriate methods for assessment; identify gaps in training, new objectives and needs.	CPA; client ministries and agencies; training institutions.	Organizational inputs.
Design of training programs and plan	Base design of programs on results of assessment after reviewing existing curricula; use feedback from past participants; formulate mix of training programs; reallocate resources and assign priorities.	Training institutions; past participants; CPA.	Technical and planning inputs.
Development of trainers	Upgrade quality of trainers through formal training; use overseas fellowships for training, if necessary; raise status and salaries of trainers.	CPA; donor agencies; ministry of finance; Cabinet.	Funds; policy support.
Development of training materials	Identify needs for indigenous training materials through an analysis of training plan; provide funds for training materials in budgets of institutions; support field work and consultancy by trainers.	Training institutions; CPA; different ministries.	Organizational inputs; funds.
Training methodologies	Derive mix of methods from training program designs and objectives; encourage experimentation in methods; suport experiential methods.	Training institutions; CPA	Technical inputs
Monitoring and evaluation of training	Establish evaluation system for training programs in CPA; encourage training institutions to set up internal evaluation systems; set up periodic review committees to assess training performance.	CPA; training institutions; client ministries.	Organizational inputs

The severity of these barriers, undoubtedly, varies from country to country. In the more developed Asian countries, the quality and availability of trainers may not be as serious a problem as in the newly independent African countries. The schools of public administration in some of the larger Latin American and Asian countries may have developed more relevant training materials and methods than those in the smaller countries. But available evidence shows that these are differences in degree only. There is much that LDC governments can do in the short run to minimize these problems.

First, institutional arrangements (committees, workshops, consultations, and so forth) to bring together the central personnel authority (CPA) and user agencies periodically would go a long way toward improving the assessment of training needs. The posting of training officers in every ministry has facilitated this process in some countries. A careful analysis of the development programs and tasks being planned for the medium term also tends to provide useful inputs for mapping the future training needs. Second, the CPA training institutions could significantly improve the designs of training programs and methodologies by taking into account these inputs. The practice of repeating the same program designs and methods without assessing the needs and feedback from past participants must be discouraged. Third, depending upon the needs of client organizations and categories of personnel and the new training designs generated, the CPA might set apart some funds for the development of new training materials; this might encourage trainers in government and autonomous institutions and university departments to invest some of their time in the field developing new training materials. Fourth, the development of trainers must be treated as critical to the success of the interventions mentioned earlier. Raising the status of trainers and upgrading their salary, as has been done in Malaysia, certainly will have a positive impact on the supply and quality of trainers. In allocating overseas training fellowships, training of trainers should receive the highest priority. Acquisition of new knowledge and skills, exposure to new methodologies and designs, and opportunities to undertake specialized studies could be enhanced through this process. Training of trainers should be seen as an investment that is complementary to the investment in the physical facilities for training. The resources required in these different interventions are marginal in terms of the government's total budget; nor do they call for major policy reforms. Yet, suitable action on these proposals could lead to a perceptible improvement in the efficient and effective use of the existing training infrastructure in LDCs.

Better Management of Training Institutions

Poor internal management is a major reason why training institutions are unable to realize their potential fully. The problem, in most cases, can be attributed to inadequate leadership, rigid management systems, and the absence of well planned internal strategies at the level of institutions. LDC governments can play a positive role in strengthening the management capabilities of their training institutions. A quick analysis of the problems of the low performers, among these institutions, is a good starting point for such an exercise.

Any attempt to improve the management of a national training institution must start with its leadership. The choice of a competent person with a strong commitment to training and willingness to stay on the job for a reasonable period (at least five years) to head the institution must receive the highest priority. In his institution building task, he will need the support of the political and bureaucratic leadership of the country. In effect, this means that his is given a high status in the government and stability in his job to enable him to fulfill his institutional mission satisfactorily.

A second requirement is that the new leader be given an adequate measure of flexibility in planning and restructuring the institution and its activities to meet the new objectives. A training institution which is expected to innovate and adapt to changing needs will require a greater measure of autonomy than is found in government agencies engaged in routine functions. Separate advisory boards and budgets for such institutions can be useful devices to augment their autonomy. A larger role for the professional staff in planning institutional strategies and programs will not only increase their commitment, but also reinforce institutional autonomy effectively.

A third requirement is the strengthening of the institution's linkages and interactions with client organizations. A more active participation of institutions in the assessment of training needs will certainly be a useful step in this direction. But more importantly, training institutions should be encouraged to reinforce their training activities by undertaking research and consultancy for ministries, development program agencies, and projects. Except for institutions which are engaged exclusively in induction training, most PAMT institutions should be able to focus on a multiplicity of activities provided a critical mass of faculty with requisite skills is assembled; this, of course, will call for some additional resources. On the other hand, institutions will also be able to earn some revenues out of their new activities. The net outflow of government funds on this account need not be as large as is often imagined. But the major gain is in upgrading the quality, relevance, and innovative capacity of the staff. This strategy has paid rich dividends in many cases and could be replicated with government support in most developing countries.

Foreign Assistance for PAMT

Foreign aid, both bilateral and multilateral, could be used to reinforce and supplement national efforts in planning and implementing the policy interventions and actions discussed earlier. There are five areas in which foreign assistance to PAMT seems particularly relevant.

One, there is a strong case for analyzing and learning from the experience of some of the more developed countries which have evolved good personnel policies and strong PAMT institutions over the years. Many newly independent LDCs have in the past based their personnel and training systems on those of the more developed countries with which they have had close historical links. However, while the systems and practices of the developed countries may have changed over the years, the developing countries may have done little to adapt. There is no reason why the developing countries shouldn't borrow again from the same countries, but it might be useful if they learnt from others as well. Donor agencies, for instance, could assist LDC governments in disseminating knowledge on new personnel systems and practices, methods for assessing training needs, evaluation of training, and monitoring of training activities. This role, however, merely facilitates learning and is not a substitute for the adaptations and choices an LDC government must make for itself.

Two, foreign assistance may play a useful role in filling important training gaps where required expertise is lacking in an LDC. Accounting and financial management in government, and sectoral training skills in agricultural and rural project management are among the gaps identified in some LDCs. To be effective, PAMT for general administrators has to be complemented by training for other categories of personnel in specialized areas and sectors.

Three, foreign assistance will be better utilized if trainers are trained. Overseas training fellowships need to be allocated more purposively for trainers rather than for tours by senior officials of governments; regional institutions can be supported to play this role, especially in smaller countries. Foreign assistance can be used also for training trainers in the more developed of developing countries which may have acquired the necessary experience and expertise.

Four, LDC governments need to evolve suitable strategies for internalizing the training resources and skills that are created through the project-related training (PRT) activities of different donor agencies. Training institutions and university departments can be encouraged to associate themselves with ongoing PRT in their areas; this will facilitate mutual learning and contribute to the building of long-term training capacity within the country. Most of the training materials and methods used in PRT could be disseminated to indigenous institutions and opportunities created for them learn from the training experience of different projects.

Five, most of the current lacunae in PAMT strategies point to a serious lack of research and development (R&D) relevant to training in LDCs. The development of training materials, better training methods, evaluation techniques, and training program designs are some areas in which continuous R&D must be undertaken. For example, if a modular approach to training is appropriate at supervisory or other lower levels, the development of modules and training materials will require a fair amount of R&D. The same is true for the development of case studies, games, and so forth. Experimental work in new methods such as action training and evaluation of their impact could also be treated as R&D. All these investments have high payoff in terms of their replicability in different countries. Collaborative efforts in these areas among institutions and countries in a region can be facilitated by donor agencies. LDC governments should encourage and support their institutions' participation in such efforts. Collaboration between LDC governments and donor agencies in research and development on these problems can help improve the utilization of the existing training infrastructure in the 1980s.

The optimal set of policy interventions and actions for improving the efficiency and effectiveness of PAMT will vary from one developing country to another. Where low performance of existing training institutions is a serious problem, a review of institutional strategies and structures may help. If specific institutions are plagued by internal problems, perhaps, there is a need for a change of leadership. Where links with clients are weak, the answer may lie in creating suitable institutional mechanisms to facilitate client-trainer interactions and finding new ways of assessing training needs. These interventions can help improve training performance in selected areas in the short run. In the long run, a better sense of direction and ability to sustain overall performance through a more comprehensive set of interventions are required; this can only be achieved through the design and implementation of a formal training policy for the public service. Increased allocation of resources and the authority to expand, decentralize, or strengthen the institutional framework for training can be accomplished by such a training policy. Changes in the broader personnel policies are also required. These realignments are necessarily more complex and time consuming. There is no doubt, however, that training effectiveness can be improved in LDCs on a long-term basis only through a strategy based on the mutually reinforcing and inter-related nature of a light mix of policy interventions and actions.

Appendix

INTAN OF MALAYSIA: A CASE OF SUCCESSFUL TRAINING STRATEGY

The National Institute of Public Administration (INTAN) was established by the Government of Malaysia in 1972 as part of a wide-ranging administrative reform initiated in the late 1960s.[1] The growing political dissatisfaction with the bureaucracy's performance in managing the increasingly complex socioeconomic development programs of the country paved the way to a governmental survey of the training needs of the public sector. A major finding of this survey was the need to establish a central training institute for the public service. It was the prompt acceptance of this recommendation by the Cabinet that led to the creation of INTAN. Given the fragmented and rudimentary training infrastructure that existed in this relatively small country, the decision to establish a large-scale, central public service training institution based largely on indigenous resources, both financial and human, was a major leap forward and a testimony to the political commitment at the highest level to human resources development in the public sector.

The New Scenario

The limited public service training programs offered under government auspices since independence has several drawbacks. They were certainly inadequate in terms of their coverage of personnel. Their focus was on classroom-oriented teaching isolated for the most part from field realities. Induction training and land administration courses dominated the training activity. There was a persistent shortage of qualified trainers. For professional and higher level administrative training, officers used to be sent abroad in large numbers. The establishment of INTAN, however, brought about significant changes in this secenario.

First of all, INTAN became the key instrument of the government for "planned training" as articulated in the new training policy adopted by the Cabinet in 1970. The new policy took a more comprehensive view of training, and provided not only for induction training, but also training in the basic work skills needed in the early stages of the individual's career, and training throughout the subsequent stages of his growth. The new approach thus challenged the popular belief that public servants selected on merit were already equipped for their jobs and that further training was wasteful.

Second, the expansion of education in the 1960s had augmented the supply of skilled manpower needed for various professions. Part of the task of INTAN was to evolve post-entry training programs for new recruits who had different levels and types of academic qualifications. In line with the new policy, a variety of training programs using diverse pedagogical methods were introduced by INTAN to meet the varying needs of public servants.

---

[1] INTAN is the Malay acronym for Institut Tadbiran Awam Negara, the National Institute of Public Administration.

Third, the new training policy permitted INTAN to organize and manage its activities in new and innovative ways. In staff development, career development linkages, and autonomy of operations, INTAN was able to depart from past practices. According to several observers, INTAN's record of growth and high performance was in no small measure due to the new training policy and the innovative approaches adopted by its leadership.

Training Policy

The training policy adopted by the Government of Malaysia in 1970 offered broad guidelines to INTAN on the objectives and scope of public service training, the categories of personnel to be trained, the assessment of training needs, types of training to be offered, linkages between training and career development, roles and responsibilities of agencies in training, and the financing and evaluation of training. These guidelines also provided for a continuous review of policy implementation and modification of policy as and when necessary.

The policy statement of 1970 declared that the objective of training was to improve the capability and efficiency of public servants "in achieving progressive public service, maximum effectiveness, proficiency and economy". Training was to be emphasized at all levels and branches of government with fair and equitable treatment of public servants in all categories. It was recognized that such training could not be provided on the job alone, and that rapid technological changes and the growing role of the state in development called for the systematic training of public servants at different points in their career.

The responsibility for the overall control of training is vested in the Cabinet Committee on Training. While the Cabinet is responsible for the formulation of training policy, it has delegated its authority to the Public Services Department (the central personnel agency) to direct, coordinate and control all training within the public service, and to advise the ministries or departments in planning and reviewing their training activities. The latter in turn are responsible for the basic training of their personnel in specific functions, both technical and clerical. Within the Public Services Department, the Training and Career Development Division is responsible for the planning, supervision and evaluation of all public service training. INTAN is the central agency within the Public Services Department responsible for organizing training programs in close collaboration with the Training and Career Development Division. The new policy also declared that the government was responsible for financing all public service training activities.

INTAN's Role and Strategy

As the training arm of the government, INTAN performs three mutually reinforcing roles. First, it offers a variety of management and administration training programs for public servants at all levels in the government. The types and duration of its programs are summarized below:

BASIC FEATURES IN INTAN'S PROGRAMS

Level	Focus and Content	Duration
Top administrators	Policy oriented seminars, workshops on new developments and managerial aids.	2-4 days
Senior officers	Advanced general management training; refresher courses on new developments.	1-4 weeks
Middle-level officers	Specialized programs in functions such as finance, personnel, new management systems and tools.	1-6 months; 1 year for degree programs.
New recruits to Malaysian Civil and Diplomatic Service	General induction, training in public administration and management with emphasis on field work and specific functions.	1 year (leading to a diploma); shorter programs not exceeding 6 months.
Lower-level employees (common to all ministries)	Work skills and knowledge of procedures and functions.	2-3 weeks.

In offering these training programs for different categories of public servants, INTAN functioned as part of a network of institutions that included departmental (ministry) training centers and the University of Malaya.

Second, INTAN has followed a deliberate strategy towards the integration of training with research and consultancy by the staff. INTAN's training officers spend a third of their time on consulting and research activities which bring them close to client organizations and real field problems. Though INTAN's activities are grouped under five departments, there is a built-in flexibility to set up work teams drawn from the different units. Sometimes such work is undertaken as part of a training program. A good example is action training which attempts to upgrade the competence of an organization as a whole. This type of training involves classroom work as well as field interventions, with trainers acting as resource persons and participants playing an active role in diagnosing organizational problems, and identifying and implementing solutions jointly in their organization.

Third, though INTAN was established as a central institution, the scope and magnitude of its work have led to a decentralization of its operations. There are seven regional centers in different parts of the country which cater especially to the training needs of lower-level employees. Decentralization has not only reduced the costs of operation, but also facilitated better adaptation to local training needs.

INTAN's new strategy has led to a significant expansion in the training of public servants in Malaysia. It has a professional staff of seventy persons. As against a total of 2,300 persons in 1972, nearly 9,000 underwent training in 1981 under INTAN's auspices, its target for 1983-84 was 15,000 persons. Even this ambitious target, however, will reach only 8% of the total number of federal and state employees. A more important feature of this expansion is that the quality and relevance of training have improved remarkably. INTAN's focus on meeting client needs and forging linkages with user ministries, its experimentation with different methods of training, and integration of research and consultancy with training have contributed to this qualitative change and a growing response of ministries to its training activities.

Innovative Features

While there are several dimensions of INTAN's operations which deserve to be noted, four areas in which the institution has performed exceptionally well are highlighted here.

Assessment of training needs. The Training and Career Development Division of the Government has introduced a system requiring departments to submit annual training bids as a means of ascertaining the managerial and administrative training needs of each agency. These bids are evaluated by the Division in terms of the expansion plans of the agency for the next five years, availability of training facilities, and budgetary resources. Simultaneously, through its formal and informal links with client departments, INTAN makes known its training plan and receives feedback from its diverse client groups. INTAN has an Advisory Committee consisting of senior officers of the central and operating agencies, University of Malaysia, and selected private sector individuals to advise its Director on the types of training programs required, and their objectives and curricula. Thus, while the Training and Career Development Division assesses training needs at the macro level, INTAN plays a pro-active role at the micro level by testing new training ideas and assessing the curricular requirements of specific programs. The matching of the two is an iterative and continuous process in which both these agencies actively collaborate.

Diversity of Training Methodologies. INTAN has an experimental approach towards questions of content and pedagogy. The changing environment and evolving national development tasks necessitate the induction of new concepts, tools and methods of learning. INTAN's experiments with action training testify to its openness to new ideas. In rural- and people- oriented programs, conventional classroom-oriented training was found to be relatively ineffective. INTAN responded by designing a new training plan that combined formal classroom work with action interventions in the field. This methodology required the involvement of different groups of staff, as well as beneficiaries, in training and working together to find answers and implement them in the field. An analysis of the methods used in training shows that though lectures are the single most popular mode, several other methods are also in vogue. Equally important is INTAN's modular approach to training which permits participants to go through a set of modules relevant to them but spread over a longer stretch of time. This, again, was a response to the problem faced by agencies of releasing officers for long periods of training.

Staff Development. Like other LDCs, Malaysia also has been plagued by a severe shortage of qualified trainers. INTAN has responded to this problem by designing a systematic plan for staff development. Its professional staff are drawn from the civil service as well as other institutions at home or abroad. Public service experience alone is not regarded as adequate qualification for a trainer. INTAN, therefore, adopted a three-pronged strategy for self-development. First, an adequate number of staff positions was created and funds earmarked so that staff shortages did not arise out of a lack of sanctioned posts. Second, training officers are required to have some years of government experience, good educational qualifications and knowledge of new developments in training. Experienced officers were sent abroad for postgraduate training in order to better equip themselves to be trainers. Third, several posts have been created to attract talented persons on contract from outside the Government to serve on the faculty. To attract competent staff, special incentives such as higher grade appointments and gratuity payments were provided. Government officers who were sponsored for training by INTAN were required to complete their tour of duty as originally agreed upon. Staff recruitment and development were thus tailored to meet INTAN's special needs.

Evaluation of Training. Both INTAN and the Training and Career Development Division are vitally concerned about the impact of training. INTAN evaluates its training activities in three different ways. First, during and after its short-term programs, INTAN attempts a "managerial" evaluation of their impact on participants. The trainers elicit participant feedback in order to improve and modify their training inputs. Second, for long-term courses, INTAN has a system of conducting formal tests/examinations for younger participants as a basis for awarding diplomas and certificates. This approach makes participants view training more seriously and motivate them towards higher performance. Third, after a year of completing their training, participants and their supervisors are brought together in conference to evaluate the contribution of training to their performance on the job. This is a recent innovation which is yet to be institutionalized. As regards evaluating the impact of training on government's overall performance, INTAN has not done much. In fact, given the interdependence of training with many other variables, disentangling the contribution of training to macro level performance is regarded as well nigh impossible.

The Training and Career Development Division evaluates a training course by asking each participant to assess the course, its relevance and usefulness. After six months, the Division elicits the views of the participant's supervisor on his performance after training. This assessment cannot be said to be conclusive as his performance could be affected by factors other than training. But the exercise is important as it conveys to the participant a strong message that the government is serious about training as an input to his career development.

Government's Facilitating Role

In terms of political commitment, resources and appropriate policies, the Government of Malaysia has provided substantial support to the work of INTAN. Attention to key appointments, career development linkages and autonomy of operation are important manifestations of this support.

The Director of INTAN is chosen with considerable care from among senior civil servants. He is responsible to the Director General of the Public Services Department and has access also to the Chief Secretary to the government. The job is perceived to be a prestigious one. The Director as well as other oficers are encouraged to complete their full term of five years. As a result, competent and stable leadership continues to be a positive feature of INTAN.

The training policy of Malaysia provides for strong linkages between career development and training. The significant point here is that this policy is being implemented. The performance of probationary officers during training, for example, is formally assessed. For some categories of staff, completion of training is stipulated as a condition for further career advancement. There is a positive effort to relate promotion to training as selection for further training is based on the officer's potential for advancement in his career. In the elite administrative service, officers are sent for post graduate specialization in certain areas, and upon return, deployed within their new areas of specialization. Training at INTAN has been made mandatory for all officers who according to the seniority list are eligible for consideration for promotion when they complete eight years of service.

Though INTAN is an integral part of the Public Services Department, it has been given an autonomous status not only in terms of maintaining and operating its own budget, but also in setting its directions and planning its activities. It has an Advisory Council with the Director General of Public Services as Chairman and senior representatives of other ministries and state governments as members. INTAN's autonomy is reinforced by the formal and informal ties its Director maintains with these and other important actors in the system.

Inspite of its impressive performance, INTAN has many gaps to fill and many challenges ahead. Its activities must expand substantially in order to offer training opportunities to all public servants. Its staff resources are far from adequate. As it decentralizes its operations, it may face more complex problems of management. While experimenting with new concepts and approaches, it must strive for a balance between the conceptual and pragmatic dimensions. These problems are in a sense no different from those many training institutions face in other LDCs. INTAN's strategies, processes, and experiences in coping with these and other challenges may offer useful insights and lessons for many other LDCs.

References

1. Based on OECD, Development Assistance (Paris, 1981, mimeo); J. Montgomery and W. Siffin (eds), Approaches to Development: Politics, Administration and Change (New York: McGraw Hill, 1966), Chapter 6. OECD countries alone have provided training assistance to LDCs of $500 million in 1980. World Bank's project-related training was of the order of $180 million in 1980. The total training assistance provided by the various UN agencies amounted to $67 million for the same year. It is estimated that private foundations and other donors together accounted for the balance of the amount.

2. See World Development Report 1980 (Washington D.C., 1980) External aid to education accounted for 9% of the total education budgets of LDCs. Between 1970 and 1975, external aid for education and training grew 13% per year at current prices. See World Bank, Education Sector Policy Paper (Washington D.C., 1980).

3. Montgomery & Siffin, op.cit.

4. Most of the data on training are maintained at the level of individual institutions. Aggregate data on training, including expenditures and outputs, are seldom collected and published by governments. This makes the task of undertaking a comprehensive international study even harder.

5. Thus, it is now common for training programs in agriculture and public health to include components on management training especially where middle and higher level specialists are involved.

6. K. Rothwell (ed), Administrative Issues in Developing Economies (Lexington, Mass., 1972), p.3.

7. Issues of methodology and control will be discussed in subsequent chapters.

8. ILO, Multinational Training Practices and Development (Geneva, 1981).

9. A. Chandler, The Visible Hand: The Managerial Revolution in America Business (Harvard, 1977), pp. 464-476.

10. J. Moris, "The Transferability of Western Management Concepts and Programs: An East African Perspective", in L. Stifel, et.al., Education and Training for Public Sector Management in Developing Countries (New York: The Rockefeller Foundation, 1977).

11. R. M. Hogarth, Evaluating Management Education (New York: Wiley & Sons, 1979); H. Baumgartel, et.al., "Management Education, Company Climate and Innovation", Journal of General Management, No.4, 1976-77, pp.17-26.

12. Frank Sutton and Theodore Smith, The Ford Foundation and Public Management in the Less Developed Countries (New York, 1975) mimeo, p.3.

13. In the late 1940s, much dissatisfaction was expressed in the UK, USA and France about the inadequacies of their respective training policies and practices. In each of these countries, important reforms were introduced to strengthen public service training which in turn had an impact on many LDCs which had close links with them. For details, see UN, A Handbook of Training in the Public Service (New York, 1966), Chapter 1.

14. Ibid, p.2.

15. United Nations, A Handbook of Public Administration (New York, 1961), p.115.

16. J. J. Ribas, Les Services de la fonction publique dans la monde (Brussels, IIAS, 1956), pp.110-120.

17. Sutton and Smith, op.cit., pp.11-13.

18. USAID, Management Development Strategy Paper: AID's Response to the Implementation Needs of the 1980's (Washington, D.C., June 1981), mimeo.

19. World Bank, Analysis of Lending for Education and Training in World Bank Projects, FY82 (Washington, D.C., 1982) mimeo.

20. Data furnished to the author by UNDP, New York.

21. OECD, op.cit.

22. Ibid.

23. ILO, Management Administration and Productivity: International Directory of Institutions (Geneva, 1981)

24. IASIA, List of Schools and Institutes of Administration (Brussels, 1981), mimeo.

25. E. Engelbert, International Cooperation for Education and Training in Public Administration/Public Management (IASIA; 1980, mimeo).

26. J. Montgomery & W. Siffin (eds), Approaches to Development: Politics, Administration and Change (McGraw Hill, New York, 1966) Chapter 6.

27. Lynton R. & Pareek U., Training for Development (Irwin, 1976), p.VII.

28. O. B. Conway Jr., "The Teaching of Public Administration" in M. Kriesbug (ed), Public Administration in Developing Countries (Washington D.C.: Brookings, 1967) p.150.

29. R. C. Collins, "Training and Education: Trends and Differences", Public Administration Review, Nov.-Dec., 1973.

30. U. S. Office of Personnel Management, Employee Training in the Federal Service, FY1930 (Washington D.C. 1981 pp.2-5.

31. M. Durupty, "Civil Service Training in Europe", in Effective Use of Training Methodologies (London: Commonwealth Secretariat, 1979), p.170.

32. Ibid, p.169.

33. Ibid, pp.168-171.

34. Government of Japan, Public Administration in Japan (Tokyo, 1982).

35. Ibid.

36. A. Raksasataya and H. Seidentopf (eds), Training in the Civil Service, Vol. 4 (APDAC, Kuala Lumpur, 1980).

37. Government of Kenya, A Committee of Inquiry: Public Service Structure, 1970-71 (Nairobi, 1971), pp.98-102.

38. A. Rweyemamu, "Some Reflections on Training Senior African Public Servants" in Effective Use of Training Methodologies (Commonwealth Secretariat, London 1979), p. 147. The newly independent Zimbabwe offers the best case of a government which initiated a massive program for public service training starting with a one-week workshop for its permanent secretaries in 1981).

39. United Nations, Strengthening Public Administration and Finances for Development in the 1980s (New York, 1978), p.33.

40. Raksasatya and Seidentopf, op.cit.

41. UN advisers familiar with several Latin American countries conveyed this view to this author in an interview.

42. Glynn Cochrane, Policies for Strengthening Local Government in Developing Countries. World Bank Staff Working papers Number 582: (Washington, DC: 1983).

43. In Malaysia and India, the lower levels account for 90% and 98% respectively.

44. Based on interviews with UN advisors dealing with Latin American countries.

45. The countries are Algeria, Benin, Botswana, Cameroon, Central African Republic, Egupt, Ethiopia, Gabon, The Gambia, Ghana, Guinea, Kenya, Lesotho, Liberia, Mauritius, Morocco, Nigeria, Senegal, Seychelles, Tanzania, Uganda, Upper Volta and Zimbabwe. See Economic Commission for Africa, Report of the Conference of Ministers' Responsible for Human Resources Planning, Development and Utilization (Addis Ababa, October, 1981, p.47).

46. As reported in Raksasatya and Seidentopf, op.cit.

47. *Ibid*, see H. M. Mathur, "Training of Civil Servants in India", p.24-30.

48. O. Adamolakun, "Strategies for Institutionalizing Public Management Education: The Nigerian Experience", in Stifel, et.al., *op.cit*. p.112.

49. *Ibid*, see I. A. Khan, "Training of Public Servants in Pakistan," p.201.

50. *Ibid*, see F. Ismail, "Training of Civil Servants in Malaysia", p.159-161.

51. UN, *Survey of Changes and Trends in Public Administration* (New York 1978), p.33.

52. Commonwealth Secretariat, *National Policies and Programs for Public Enterprises Management Training* (London, 1979).

53. P. A. Segovia, "Training of Civil Servants in the Philippines" in Ratsataya & Seidentopf, *op.cit*. p.297.

54. Mathur, *op.cit*. p.68.

55. Mathur, *Ibid*, p.63.

56. Ismail, *op.cit*. p.144.

57. This account is based on J. Montgomery, "The Great Training Robbery", mimeo.

58. The major findings of this survey was that the training requirements of rural managers in Zambia included several topics which were not covered by the original curriculum. The total number of incidents involving the latter constituted less than 30% of the number of incidents reported in response to the critical incident survey. Thus the CAFRAD curriculum had missed most of the rural managers' real needs. As a result of this finding, CAFRAD devised a new curriculum, tested it in Kenya, and used it for its future training courses in Africa.

59. Raksasatya and Seidentopf, *op.cit*.

60. ECA, *op.cit*. p.47.

61. UN, *Survey of Changes and Trends in Public Adminstration and Finance for Development 1975-77* (New York, 1978), pp.33-38; Zimbabwe's experience is based on the author's personal knowledge.

62. *Ibid*.

63. Commonwealth Secretariat, *National Policies and Programmes for Public Enterprise Management Training* (London, 1979).

64. G. Iglesius, et.al. (eds), *Training Public Enterprise Managers* (APDAC, 1980.

65. Commonwealth Secretariat, *op.cit*. pp.62-65.

66. ILO, *op.cit*.

67. Mathur, *op.cit*.

68. Asian and Pacific Development Centre, *Country Notes on the Status of Training in Government* (Kuala Lumpur, 1975). The countries covered are Afganistan, Bangladesh, Iran, Malaysia, Nepal, Pakistan and Sri Lanka.

69. Based on *Public Administration Training Institutions in Africa*: An Inventory (NASPAA & USAID, Washington D.C., 1980).

70. The Indian Institute of Public Administration began with a pre-entry graduate program, but had to close it as placement of graduates in government posed problems. This institute now is engaged chiefly in IST.

71. World Bank, *Review of Training in Bank Financing Projects* (Washington D.C. 1982), Report No. 3834.

72. UN, *Changes and Trends in Public Administration and Finance for Development, 1975-77* (New York, 1982).

73. Based on Segovia, *op.cit*., pp.283-285.

74. Based on the author's correspondence with IRMA.

75. Commonwealth Secretariat, *Training Systems and Curriculum Development for Public Enterprise Management* (London, 1979).

76. Ratsastya & Seidentopf, *op.cit*.

77. J. Jreisat, *op.cit*. p.58.

78. We are referring here to the evaluation of all types of training and not merely PAMT. Much has been written about the theory and methods of evaluation. But most evaluation studies are internal to the organizations which commission them and are not in the public domain.

79. For example, reports of the committees which evaluated the Kenya Institute Administration, Indian Institute of Public Administration, etc., are public documents.

80. Based on internal reports made available to us.

81. UN, *Report on the Arusha Working on Curriculum Development*, 1982 (mimeo).

82. Based on an internal report prepared by the UNDDA for the *World Development Report*.

83. UN, *A Survey of Changes and Trends in Public Administration & Finance* 1975-77 (New York, 1978), p.33.

84. DAC, op.cit.

85. OED, Review of Training in Bank-Financed Projects (World Bank, Washington, D.C. 1982).

86. W. Siffin, "Two Decades of Public Administration in Developing Countries," Public Administration Review, January-February, 1976.

87. Ibid.

88. B. Schaffer, Administrative Training and Development (Praeger, New York, 1974) p.54.

89. Schaffer, African Public Management and Management Training (mimeo, 1981).

90. See the following reports: Raksasatya & Scidentopf, op.cit; APDAC, Country Notes on the Status of Training in Government, 1975; Inayatullah, op.cit; and Commonwealth Secretariat, op.cit.

91. Engelbert, op.cit.

92. Government of Japan, Public Administration in Japan (Tokyo, 1982).

93. USOPM, Employee Training in the Federal Service (Washington, D.C. 1981) See R. Collins, "Training and Education: Trends and Differences," Public Administration Review, November-December, 1973, p.510. The estimate for Japan is based on the auditor's discussion with officials of NPA in Tokyo.

94. ILO, Multinational Training Practices and Development (Geneva, 1981).

95. This estimate was prepared specially for the present study by the Government of Malaysia.

96. Government of India, Administrative Reforms Commission on Training (New Delhi, 1969), p.21.

97. Engelbert, op.cit.

98. Schaffer, op.cit.

99. Inayatullah (ed.) Management Training for Development: The Asian Experience (APDA, Kuala Lumpur, 1975), p.77.

100. K. K. Chowdhury, "Strategies for Institutionalizing Public Management Education: The Indian Experience and O. Adamolekun, "Strategies for Institutionalizing Public Management Education: The Nigerian Experience," in Stifel, et.al., op.cit.

101. J. Jreisat, "Public Administration and Training: Cases from Jordan and Saudi Arabia," Arab Journal of Administration, April 1982, pp.56-60.

102. ILO, Managing a Management Development Institution (Geneva, 1982).

103. The following discussion is based on a comparative study presented in Stifel, et.al., op.cit.

104. K. Chowdhury, op.cit.

105. NASPA & USAID, Mid-Term Evaluation of PAID (Washington, D.C., 1980).

106. F. Ismail, "Training of Civil Servants in Malaysia," in Raksas? and Seidentopf, op.cit.

107. Government of Kenya, Report of the Committee of Review into the Kenya Institute of Administration (Nairobi, 1979).

108. Wendell Shaffer, Evaluation of Central America Training Institutions.

109. ILO, op.cit. Chapter 2.

110. Ibid. See Chapters 4-6.

111. See the reference to these traditions in Chapter II. It is interesting to note that the Francophone and Anglophone LDCs even today bear the distinct imprint of these traditions in training as well as in the broader civil service systems and practices.

112. A good example is the World Bank. Its sectoral and project appraisal methodologies did influence the pattern of training in several institutions. The evolution in the Economic Development Institute's own training programs and its colloboration with other institutions reflect this trend.

113. See Mathur, op.cit. pp.54-60. The Indian Government allocated special funds in its development plans to support this training.

114. See K. Korten, "Community Organization and Rural Development: A Learning Process Approach," Public Administration Review, 40:5 (1980); G. Honadle and J. Hannah, "Management Performance for Rural Development: Packaged Training for Capacity Building," Public Administration and Development 1982 (forthcoming). This paper lists 23 projects in 18 LDCs where action training has been tried.

115. B. F. Skinner, Science and Human Behaviour (New York, MacMillan, 1954); Skinner, "The Science of Learning and the Art of Teaching", Harvard Educational Review, 24, 1954, pp.86-97. Kurt Lewin, "Frontiers in Group Dynamics", Human Relations, Vol. 1, pp.2-38; R. Beckhard, Organization Development: Strategies and Models (Addison Wesley, 1968).

116. INTAN in Malaysia which has experienced with a variety of methods reports that still 44% of its programs sessions use the lecture method. See Ismail, op.cit.

117. Commonwealth Secretariat, Effective Use of Training Methodologies (London, 1979). This finding may have been biased by its rather unrepresentative sample; it is also possible that the relative importance of different methods was not properly measured by this survey.

118. Based on F. Ismail, op.cit. and personal discussions of the author with other officials.

119. Based on D. Korten (ed), Population and Social Development: A Challenge for Management Schools (IIESA, Caracas, 1979).

120. R. Abramson & W. Halset, Planning for Improved Enterprise Performance (ILO, Geneva, 1979).

World Bank Publications of Related Interest

Accelerated Development in Sub-Saharan Africa: An Agenda for Action

In the fall of 1979, the African Governors of the World Bank addressed a memorandum to the Bank's president expressing their alarm at the dim economic prospects for the nations of sub-Saharan Africa and asking that the Bank prepare a "special paper on the economic development problems of these countries" and an appropriate program for helping them. This report, building on the *Lagos Plan of Action*, is the response to that request.

The report discusses the factors that explain slow economic growth in Africa in the recent past, analyzes policy changes and program orientations needed to promote faster growth, and concludes with a set of recommendations to donors, including the recommendation that aid to Africa should double in real terms to bring about renewed African development and growth in the 1980s. The report's agenda for action is general; it indicates broad policy and program directions, overall priorities for action, and key areas for donor attention. Like the *Lagos Plan*, the report recognizes that Africa has enormous economic potential, which awaits fuller development.

1981; 2nd printing 1982. 198 pages (including statistical annex, bibliography).

French: Le développement accéléré en afrique au sud du Sahara: programme indicatif d'action.

Stock Nos. SA-1981-E, SA-1981-F. Free of charge.

The Design of Development
Jan Tinbergen

Formulates a coherent government policy to further development objectives and outlines methods to stimulate private investments.

The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1958; 6th printing, 1966. 108 pages (including 4 annexes, index).

LC 58-9458. ISBN 0-8018-0633-X, $5.00 (£3.00) paperback.

Development Strategies in Semi-Industrial Economies
Bela Balassa

Provides an analysis of development strategies in semi-industrial economies that have established an industrial base. Endeavors to quantify the systems of incentives that are applied in six semi-industrial developing economies—Argentina, Colombia, Israel, Korea, Singapore, and Taiwan—and to indicate the effects of these systems on the allocation of resources, international trade, and economic growth.

The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1982. 416 pages (including appendixes, index).
LC 81-15558. ISBN 0-8018-2569-5, $39.95 hardcover.

Eastern and Southern Africa: Past Trends and Future Prospects
Ravi Gulhati

World Bank Staff Working Paper No. 413. August 1980. 24 pages.

Stock No. WP-0413. $3.00.

Economic Development Projects and Their Appraisal: Cases and Principles from the Experience of the World Bank
John A. King

The English-language edition is out of print.

French: Projets de développement économique et leur évaluation. *Dunod Editeur, 24–26, boulevard de l'Hôpital, 75005 Paris, France. 1969.*

99 francs.

Spanish: La evaluacion de proyectors de desarrollo ecońomico. *Editorial Tecnos, 1970. 545 pages (including indexes).*

800 pesetas.

Economic Growth and Human Resources
Norman Hicks, assisted by Jahangir Boroumand

World Bank Staff Working Paper No. 408. July 1980. iv + 36 pages (including 3 appendixes, bibliography, and references).

Stock No. WP-0408. $3.00.

NEW

The Extent of Poverty in Latin America
Oscar Altimir

This work originated in a research project for the measurement and analysis of income distribution in the Latin American countries, undertaken jointly by the Economic Commission for Latin America and the World Bank. Presents estimates of the extent of absolute poverty for ten Latin American countries and for the region as a whole in the 1970s.

World Bank Staff Working Paper No. 522. 1982. 117 pages.

ISBN 0-8213-0012-1. $5.00.

First Things First: Meeting Basic Human Needs in the Developing Countries

Paul Streeten; with
Shahid Javed Burki,
Mahbub ul Haq,
Norman Hicks,
and Frances Stewart

The basic needs approach to economic development is one way of helping the poor emerge from their poverty. It enables them to earn or obtain the necessities for life—nutrition, housing, water and sanitation, education, and health—and thus to increase their productivity.

This book answers the critics of the basic needs approach, views this approach as a logical step in the evolution of economic analysis and development policy, and presents a clearsighted interpretation of the issues. Based on the actual experience of various countries—their successes and failures—the book is a distillation of World Bank studies of the operational implications of meeting basic needs. It also discusses the presumed conflict between economic growth and basic needs, the relation between the New International Economic Order and basic needs, and the relation between human rights and basic needs.

Oxford University Press, 1981; 2nd paperback printing, 1982. 224 pages (including appendix, bibliography, index).

LC 81-16836, ISBN 0-19-520-368-2, $18.95 hardcover; ISBN 0-19-520-369-0, $7.95 paperback.

The Hungarian Economic Reform, 1968–81

Bela Balassa

Reviews the Hungarian experience with the economic reform introduced in 1968 and provides a short description of the antecedents of the reform. Analyzes specific reform measures concerning agriculture, decisionmaking by industrial firms, price determination, the exchange rate, export subsidies, import protection, and investment decisions and indicates their effects on the economy. Also examines the economic effects of tendencies toward recentralization in the 1970s, as well as recent policy measures aimed at reversing these tendencies.

World Bank Staff Working Paper No. 506. February 1982. 31 pages (including references).

Stock No. WP-0506. $3.00.

Implementing Programs of Human Development

Edited by Peter T. Knight;
prepared by Nat J. Colletta,
Jacob Meerman, and others.

World Bank Staff Working Paper No. 403. July 1980. iv + 372 pages (including references).

Stock No. WP-0403. $15.00.

International Technology Transfer: Issues and Policy Options

Frances Stewart

World Bank Staff Working Paper No. 344. July 1979. xii + 166 pages (including references).

Stock No. WP-0344. $5.00.

Levels of Poverty: Policy and Change

Amartya Sen

World Bank Staff Working Paper No. 401. July 1980. 91 pages (including references).

Stock No. WP-0401. $3.00.

Models of Growth and Distribution for Brazil

Lance Taylor, Edmar L. Bacha,
Eliana Cardoso,
and Frank J. Lysy

Explores the Brazilian experience from the point of view of political economy and computable general equilibrium income distribution models.

Oxford University Press, 1980. 368 pages (including references, appendixes, index).

LC 80-13786. ISBN 0-19-520206-6, $27.50 hardcover; ISBN 0-19-520207-4, $14.95 paperback.

Patterns of Development, 1950-1970
Hollis Chenery
and Moises Syrquin

A comprehensive interpretation of the structural changes that accompany the growth of developing countries, using cross-section and time-series analysis to study the stability of observed patterns and the nature of time trends.

Oxford University Press, 1975; 3rd paperback printing, 1980. 250 pages (including technical appendix, statistical appendix, bibliography, index).

LC 74-29172. ISBN 0-19-920075-0, $19.95 hardcover; ISBN 0-19-920076-9, $8.95 paperback.

Spanish: La estructura del crecimiento ecónomico: un analisis para el período 1950–1970. *Editorial Teconos, 1978.*

ISBN 84-309-0741-6, 615 pesetas.

Poverty and Basic Needs Series

A series of booklets prepared by the staff of the World Bank on the subject of basic needs. The series includes general studies that explore the concept of basic needs, country case studies, and sectoral studies.

Brazil
Peter T. Knight and
Ricardo J. Moran

An edited and updated edition of the more detailed publication, *Brazil: Human Resources Special Report* (see description under *Country Studies* listing).

December 1981. 98 pages (including statistical appendix, map). English.

Stock No. BN-8103. $5.00.

Malnourished People: A Policy View
Alan Berg

Discusses the importance of adequate nutrition as an objective, as well as a means of economic development. Outlines the many facets of the nutrition problem and shows how efforts to improve nutrition can help alleviate much of the human and economic waste in the developing world.

June 1981. 108 pages (including 6 appendixes, notes). English. French and Spanish (forthcoming).

Stock Nos. BN-8104-E, BN-8104-F, BN-8104-S. $5.00.

Meeting Basic Needs: An Overview
Mahbub ul Haq and
Shahid Javed Burki

Presents a summary of the main findings of studies undertaken in the World Bank as part of a program for reducing absolute poverty and meeting basic needs.

September 1980. 28 pages (including 2 annexes). English, French, Spanish, Japanese, and Arabic.

Stock Nos. BN-8001-E, BN-8001-F, BN-8001-S, BN-8001-J, BN-8001-A. $3.00 paperback.

Shelter
Anthony A. Churchill

Defines the elements that constitute shelter; discusses the difficulties encountered in developing shelter programs for the poor; estimates orders of magnitude of shelter needs for the next twenty years; and proposes a strategy for meeting those needs.

September 1980. 39 pages. English, French, and Spanish.

Stock Nos. BN-8002-E, BN-8002-F, BN-8002-S. $3.00 paperback.

Water Supply and Waste Disposal

Discusses the size of the problem of meeting basic needs in water supply and waste disposal and its significance to development in the context of the International Drinking Water Supply and Sanitation Decade. Examines the Bank's past role in improving water supply and waste disposal facilities in developing countries and draws conclusions for the future.

September 1980. 46 pages. English, French, Spanish, and Arabic.

Stock Nos. BN-8003-E, BN-8003-F, BN-8003-S, BN-8003-A. $3.00 paperback.

Poverty and the Development of Human Resources: Regional Perspective
Willem Bussink, David Davies,
Roger Grawe, Basil Kavalsky,
and Guy P. Pfeffermann

World Bank Staff Working Paper No. 406. July 1980. iii + 197 pages (including 7 tables, 2 appendixes, references, footnotes).

Stock No. WP-0406. $5.00.

NEW

Poverty and Human Development
Paul Isenman and others

Since economic growth alone has not reduced absolute poverty, it has been necessary to consider other strategies. The strategy examined in this study — human development — epitomizes the idea that poor people should be helped to help themselves.

Four chapters provide an overview of alternative strategies; a detailed look at health, education, nutrition, and fertility; lessons from existing programs; and an examination of broader issues in planning.

Oxford University Press. 1982. 96 pages (including statistical appendix).

LC 82-2153. ISBN 0-19-520389-5, $7.95 paperback.

NEW

Reforming the New Economic Mechanism in Hungary
Bela Balassa

Evaluates the reform measures taken in 1980 and 1981 (price setting, the exchange rate and protection, wage determination and personal incomes, investment decisions, and the organizational structure) that aim at the further development of the Hungarian New Economic Mechanism, introduced on January 1, 1968.

World Bank Staff Working Paper No. 534. 1982. 56 pages.

ISBN 0-8213-0048-2. $3.00.

NEW

Social Infrastructure and Services in Zimbabwe
Rashid Faruqee

The black majority government of Zimbabwe, coming to power after a long struggle for independence, has announced its strong commitment to social services to benefit the vast majority of the population. This paper looks at issues related to education, health, housing, and other important sectors and reviews specific plans and resource requirements to help improve the standard of living of the population.

World Bank Staff Working Paper No. 495. October 1981. 111 pages (including bibliography, map).

Stock No. WP-0495. $5.00.

Structural Change and Development Policy
Hollis Chenery

A retrospective look at Chenery's thought and writing over the past two decades and an extension of his work in *Redistribution with Growth* and *Patterns of Development.* Develops a set of techniques for analyzing structural changes and applies them to some major problems of developing countries today.

Oxford University Press, 1979; 2nd paperback printing, 1982. 544 pages (including references, index).

LC 79-18026. ISBN 0-19-520094-2, $34.50 hardcover; ISBN 0-19-520095-0, $12.95 paperback.

French: Changement des structures et politique de développement. *Economica, 1981.*

ISBN 2-7178-0404-8, 80 francs.

Spanish: Cambio estructural y política de desarrollo. *Editorial Tecnos, 1980.*

ISBN 84-309-0845-5, 1,000 pesetas.

Tourism—Passport to Development? Perspectives on the Social and Cultural Effects of Tourism in Developing Countries
Emanuel de Kadt, editor

The first serious effort at dealing with the effects of tourism development in a broad sense, concentrating on social and cultural questions.

A joint World Bank–Unesco study. Oxford University Press, 1979. 378 pages (including maps, index).

LC 79-18116. ISBN 0-19-520149-3, $24.95 hardcover; ISBN 0-19-520150-7, $9.95 paperback.

French: Le tourisme—passport pour le développement: regards sur les effets socioculturels du tourisme dans les pays en voie de développement. Economica, 1980.

49 francs.

NEW

Tribal Peoples and Economic Development: Human Ecologic Considerations
Robert Goodland

At the current time, approximately 200 million tribal people live in all regions of the world and number among the poorest of the poor. This paper describes the problems associated with the development process as it affects tribal peoples; it outlines the requisites for meeting the human ecologic needs of tribal peoples; and presents general principles that are designed to assist the Banks staff and project designers in incorporating appropriate procedures to ensure the survival of tribal peoples and to assist with their development.

May 1982. vii + 111 pages (including 7 annexes, bibliography).

ISBN 0-8213-0010-5. $5.00.

The Tropics and Economic Development: A Provocative Inquiry into the Poverty of Nations
Andrew M. Kamarck

Examines major characteristics of the tropical climates that are significant to economic development.

The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1976; 2nd printing, 1979. 128 pages (including maps, bibliography, index).

LC 76-17242. ISBN 0-8018-1891-5, $11.00 (£7.75) hardcover; ISBN 0-8018-1903-2, $5.00 (£3.50) paperback.

French: Les tropiques et le développement économique: un regard sans complaisance sur la pauvreté des nations. *Economica, 1978.*

ISBN 2-7178-0110-3, 25 francs.

Spanish: Los trópicos y desarrollo económico: reflexiones sobre la pobreza de las naciones. *Editorial Tecnos, 1978.*

ISBN 84-309-0740-8, 350 pesetas.

Twenty-five Years of Economic Development, 1950 to 1975
David Morawetz

A broad assessment of development efforts shows that, although the remarkably successful in achieving growth, the distribution of its benefits among and within countries has been less satisfactory.

The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1977; 3rd printing, 1981. 136 pages (including statistical appendix, references).

LC 77-17243. ISBN 0-8018-2134-7, $16.50 (£8.00) hardcover; ISBN 0-8018-2092-8, $7.95 (£3.75) paperback.

French: Vingt-cinq années de développement économique: 1950 à 1975. *Economica, 1978.*

ISBN 2-7178-0038-7, 26 francs.

Spanish: Veinticinco años de desarrollo económico: 1950 a 1975. *Editorial Tecnos, 1978.*

ISBN 84-309-0792-0, 350 pesetas.

World Development Report

A large-format series of annual studies of about 200 pages, the *World Development Report*, since its inception, has been what *The Guardian* has called "a most remarkable publication. It is the nearest thing to having an annual report on the present state of the planet and the people who live on it." Each issue brings not only an overview of the state of development, but also a detailed analysis of such topics as structural change, the varying experiences of low- and middle-income countries, the relation of poverty and human resource development, global and national adjustment, and agriculture and food stability. Each contains a statistical annex, World Development Indicators, that provides profiles of more than 120 countries in twenty-five multipage tables. The data cover such subjects as demography, industry, trade, energy, finance, and development assistance and such measures of social conditions as education, health, and nutrition.

World Development Report 1982
(See Publications of Particular Interest for description and sales information.)

World Development Report 1981
(Discusses adjustment—global and national—to promote sustainable growth in the changing world economy.)

World Development Report 1980
(Discusses adjustment and growth in the 1980s and poverty and human development.)

World Development Report 1979
(Discusses development prospects and international policy issues, structural change, and country development experience and issues.)

World Development Report 1978
(Disusses the development experience, 1950–75, development priorities in the middle-income developing countries, and prospects for alleviating poverty.)

REPRINTS

Basic Needs: The Case of Sri Lanka
Paul Isenman

World Bank Reprint Series: Number 197. Reprinted from World Development, *vol. 8 (1980): 237-58.*

Stock No. RP-0197. Free of charge.

Brazilian Socioeconomic Development: Issues for the Eighties
Peter T. Knight

World Bank Reprint Series: Number 203. Reprinted from World Development, *vol. 9, no. 11/12 (1981):1063-82.*

Stock No. RP-0203. Free of charge.

Indigenous Anthropologists and Development-Oriented Research
Michael M. Cernea

World Bank Reprint Series: Number 208. Reprinted from Indigenous Anthropology in Non-Western Countries, *edited by Hussein Fahim (Durham, North Carolina: Carolina Academic Press, 1982):121-37.*

Stock No. RP-0208. Free of charge.

Latin America and the Caribbean: Economic Performance and Policies
Guy P. Pfeffermann

World Bank Reprint Series: Number 228. Reprinted from The Southwestern Review of Management and Economics, *vol. 2, no. 1 (Winter 1982):129-72.*
Stock No. RP-0228. Free of charge.

Modernization and Development Potential of Traditional Grass Roots Peasant Organizations
Michael M. Cernea

World Bank Reprint Series: Number 215. Reprinted from Directions of Change: Modernization Theory, Research, and Realities. *Boulder, Colorado: Westview Press (1981): chapter 5.*

Stock No. RP-0215. Free of charge.

WORLD BANK PUBLICATIONS
ORDER FORM

SEND TO:

WORLD BANK PUBLICATIONS
P.O. BOX 37525
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20013
U.S.A.

or

WORLD BANK PUBLICATIONS
66, AVENUE D'IÉNA
75116 PARIS, FRANCE

Name: ____

Address: ____

____

Stock or ISBN #	Author, Title	Qty.	Price	Total

Sub-Total Cost: __________

Postage & handling fee for more than two free items ($1.00 each): __________

Total copies: __________ Air mail surcharge ($2.00 each): __________

TOTAL PAYMENT ENCLOSED: __________

Make checks payable: WORLD BANK PUBLICATIONS

Prepayment on orders from individuals is requested. Purchase orders are accepted from booksellers, library suppliers, libraries, and institutions. All prices include cost of postage by the least expensive means. The prices and publication dates quoted in this Catalog are subject to change without notice.

No refunds will be given for items that cannot be filled. Credit will be applied towards future orders.

No more than two free publications will be provided without charge. Requests for additional copies will be filled at a charge of US $1.00 per copy to cover handling and postage costs.

Airmail delivery will require a prepayment of US $2.00 per copy.

Mail-order payment to the World Bank need not be in U.S. dollars, but the amount remitted must be at the rate of exchange on the day the order is placed. The World Bank will also accept Unesco coupons.

The World Bank

Headquarters:
1818 H Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20433, U.S.A.

Telephone: (202) 477-1234
Telex: WUI 64145 WORLDBANK
RCA 248423 WORLDBK
Cable address: INTBAFRAD
WASHINGTONDC

European Office:
66, avenue d'Iéna
75116 Paris, France

Telephone: (1) 723-54.21
Telex: 842-620628

Tokyo Office:
Kokusai Building
1-1, Marunouchi 3-chome
Chiyoda-ku, Tokyo 100, Japan

Telephone: (03) 214-5001
Telex: 781-26838